

# Cofnod y Trafodion The Record of Proceedings

[Y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd](#)

[The Environment and Sustainability Committee](#)

26/11/2015

[Trawsgrifiadau'r Pwyllgor](#)  
[Committee Transcripts](#)



Cynulliad  
Cenedlaethol  
Cymru

National  
Assembly for  
Wales

## Cynnwys Contents

- 7 Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon  
Introductions, Apologies and Substitutions
- 8 Bil yr Amgylchedd (Cymru)—Cyfnod 2—Ystyried y Gwelliannau  
Environment (Wales) Bill—Stage 2—Consideration of Amendments
- 9 Grŵp 1: Rheoli Cynaliadwy ar Adnoddau Naturiol ac Egwyddorion  
(Gwelliannau 14, 91, 42, 21, 22, 1, 2, 15, 16, 43, 118, 119, 44 ac 20)  
Group 1: Sustainable Management of Natural Resources and Principles  
(Amendments 14, 91, 42, 21, 22, 1, 2, 15, 16, 43, 118, 119, 44 and  
20)
- 25 Grŵp 2: Biomrywiaeth (Gwelliannau 92, 79, 93, 94, 95, 96, 80, 97, 81,  
3, 23, 24, 26, 99, 82, 28, 102 a 104)  
Group 2: Biodiversity (Amendments 92, 79, 93, 94, 95, 96, 80, 97, 81,  
3, 23, 24, 26, 99, 82, 28, 102 and 104)
- 41 Grŵp 3: Adroddiad ar Gyflwr Adnoddau Naturiol (Gwelliannau 120, 17,  
25, 98, 45, 46, 100, 56, 57 a 78)  
Group 3: State of Natural Resources Report (Amendments 120, 17, 25,  
98, 45, 46, 100, 56, 57 and 78)
- 55 Grŵp 4: Polisi Adnoddau Naturiol Cenedlaethol (Gwelliannau 83, 101,  
47, 27, 48, 121, 122, 18, 4 a 103)  
Group 4: National Natural Resources Policy (Amendments 83, 101, 47,  
27, 48, 121, 122, 18, 4 and 103)
- 66 Grŵp 5: Datganiadau Ardal (Gwelliannau 29, 84, 123, 50, 19, 124, 5,  
49, 105, 85, 86, 87, 88, 13 a 134)  
Group 5: Area Statements (Amendments 29, 84, 123, 50, 19, 124, 5,  
49, 105, 85, 86, 87, 88, 13 and 134)
- 81 Grŵp 6: Cynlluniau Arbrofol (Gwelliannau 51, 52, 125, 53, 54, a 55)  
Group 6: Experimental Schemes (Amendments 51, 52, 125, 53, 54,  
and 55)
- 88 Grŵp 7: Newid Hinsawdd: Targedau a Chyllidebau (Gwelliannau 30,  
58, 106, 59, 60A, 60B, 60, 107, 108, 109, 61, 62, 63, 64, 31, 127,  
110, 111, 89, 65, 66, 6, 7, 68, 71, 72, 73, 36 a 74)

Group 7: Climate Change: Targets and Budgets (Amendments 30, 58, 106, 59, 60A, 60B, 60, 107, 108, 109, 61, 62, 63, 64, 31, 127, 110, 111, 89, 65, 66, 6, 7, 68, 71, 72, 73, 36 and 74)

98 Grŵp 8: Newid Hinsawdd: Adroddiadau, Datganiadau a Chyngor (Gwelliannau 126, 112, 32, 113, 33, 67, 34, 8, 9, 10, 114, 115, 69, 70, 35, 116, 11, 12, 90 a 117)

Group 8: Climate Change: Reports, Statements and Advice (Amendments 126, 112, 32, 113, 33, 67, 34, 8, 9, 10, 114, 115, 69, 70, 35, 116, 11, 12, 90 and 117)

131 Grŵp 9: Bagiau Siopa a Gwastraff (Gwelliannau 37, 128, 38, 39, 129, 130, 40, 131, 132, 75, 41)

Group 9: Carrier Bags and Waste (Amendments 37, 128, 38, 39, 129, 130, 40, 131, 132, 75, 41)

148 Grŵp 10: Trwyddedu Morol a Draenio Tir (Gwelliannau 133, 76 a 77)

Group 10: Marine Licensing and Land Drainage (Amendments 133, 76 and 77)

Cofnodir y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd.

The proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included.

**Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol**  
**Committee members in attendance**

Mick Antoniw	Llafur Labour
Jeff Cuthbert	Llafur Labour
Russell George	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Llyr Gruffydd	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Janet Haworth	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Alun Ffred Jones	Plaid Cymru (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) The Party of Wales (Committee Chair)
Julie Morgan	Llafur Labour
William Powell	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats
Jenny Rathbone	Llafur Labour
Joyce Watson	Llafur Labour

**Eraill yn bresennol**  
**Others in attendance**

Andy Fraser	Pennaeth Rheoli Adnoddau Naturiol, Llywodraeth Cymru Head of Natural Resources Management, Welsh Government
Lori Frater	Cynghorydd Technegol—Diwygio Deddfwriaethol, Llywodraeth Cymru Technical Adviser—Legislative Reform, Welsh Government
Carl Sargeant	Aelod Cynulliad, Llafur, y Gweinidog Cyfoeth Naturiol Assembly Member, Labour, the Minister for Natural Resources

**Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol**  
**National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance**

Alun Davidson	Clerc Clerk
Lisa Salkeld	Cynghorydd Cyfreithiol Legal Adviser
Adam Vaughan	Dirprwy Clerc Deputy Clerk

*Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 09:29.*  
*The meeting began at 09:29.*

**Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon**  
**Introductions, Apologies and Substitutions**

[1] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Bore da. A gaf i eich croesawu chi fel Aelodau, y Gweinidog a'i gynghorwyr a'r cyhoedd i'r cyfarfod? Fe wyddoch fod y cyfarfod yn un dwyieithog. Mae'r cyfarfod yn cael ei ddarlledu, a bydd trawsgrifiad o'r trafodion yn cael ei gyhoeddi. A gaf i eich atgoffa i ddiffodd eich ffonau symudol? A gaf i atgoffa'r Aelodau a'r tystion nad oes angen cyffwrdd â'r microffonau? Os bydd larwm tân, dilynwch y tywyswyr. Dim ymddiheuriadau ac felly dim dirprwyon.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Good morning. May I welcome you as Members, the Minister and his advisers and the public to this meeting? You will know that the meeting is a bilingual one. This meeting is being broadcast, and a transcript of the proceedings will be published. May I remind you to switch off your mobile phones? May I remind Members and witnesses that there's no need to touch the microphones? Should a fire alarm sound, please follow the ushers. There are no apologies. So, there are no substitutions.

09:30

## Bil yr Amgylchedd (Cymru)—Cyfnod 2—Ystyried y Gwelliannau Environment (Wales) Bill—Stage 2—Consideration of Amendments

[2] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Pwrpas y cyfarfod yw cynnal trafodion Cyfnod 2 ar Fil yr Amgylchedd (Cymru). Mae gennych restr o welliannau wedi'u didoli a'r gwelliannau wedi'u grwpio i'w trafod. Y rhestr o welliannau wedi'u didoli ydy'r rhestr o'r holl welliannau a gyflwynwyd wedi'u didoli yn y drefn y mae'r adrannau'n ymddangos yn y Bil. Ar gyfer y cyfarfod hwn, y drefn ar gyfer trafod y gwelliannau fydd adrannau 1 i 89, atodlenni 1 i 2 a'r teitl hir. Cewch weld o'r ddogfen rhestr o welliannau wedi'u grwpio fod y gwelliannau wedi'u grwpio i hwyluso'r drafodaeth. Ond, mae'r drefn y cânt eu galw a'u cynnig, er mwyn gwneud penderfyniad arnynt, yn dilyn y rhestr o welliannau wedi'u didoli. Felly, bydd yn rhaid ichi ddilyn y ddau bapur.

[3] Bydd un ddadl ar bob grŵp o welliannau a dylai unrhyw Aelod sy'n dymuno siarad am grŵp penodol gyfleu hynny yn y modd arferol. Byddaf yn galw ar y Gweinidog i siarad ar bob grŵp. Yn unol â'r confensiwn y cytunwyd arno gyda'r Pwyllgor Busnes, mi fyddaf i, fel Cadeirydd, yn cynnig gwelliannau yn enw'r Gweinidog. Os nad yw'r Gweinidog am imi gynnig gwelliant penodol, yna mi fydd yn dweud wrthyf.

[4] Yn unol â'r arfer, ni ddisgwylir

The purpose of this meeting is the consideration of amendments at Stage 2 of Environment (Wales) Bill. You have the marshalled list and the groupings list for discussion. The marshalled list is the list of all amendments tabled marshalled into the order in which the sections appear in the Bill. For this meeting, the order in which we'll be considering the amendments will be sections 1 to 89, schedules 1 to 2 and the long title. You will see from the groupings list that the amendments have been grouped to facilitate debate. But, the order in which they are called and moved to make the decision is dictated by the marshalled list. So, you will need to follow both papers.

There will be one debate on each group of amendments and if a Member wishes to speak to amendments, they should indicate in the normal manner. I will call the Minister to speak on each group. In accordance with the convention agreed by the Business Committee, as Chair, I will move the amendments in the name of the Minister. If the Minister does not wish for me to move a specific amendment, then he should let me know.

In accordance with usual practice,

i gynghorwyr cyfreithiol y pwyllgor a'r Gweinidog ddarparu cyngor ar lafar yn ystod y cyfarfod. Ond, os yw Aelod yn dymuno gofyn am gyngor cyfreithiol yn ystod y trafodion, bydd angen gwneud hynny drwy basio nodyn i'r cynghorydd cyfreithiol. Mi fyddaf yn galw egwyl ar ôl y trydydd grŵp o welliannau'r bore yma, am 10 munud, ac fe fyddwn yn torri am ginio am 12:30, neu cyn hynny, yn dibynnu ar le byddwn wedi cyrraedd. lawn?

legal advisers to the committee and the Minister are not expected to provide advice vocally during the meeting. But, if Members wish to seek legal advice during proceedings, please do so by passing a note to the legal adviser. I will call a break after the third group of amendments this morning, for some 10 minutes, and we will break for lunch at about 12:30, or earlier, depending on where we have reached. Is everyone happy?

**Grŵp 1: Rheoli Cynaliadwy ar Adnoddau Naturiol ac Egwyddorion  
(Gwelliannau 14, 91, 42, 21, 22, 1, 2, 15, 16, 43, 118, 119, 44 ac 20)  
Group 1: Sustainable Management of Natural Resources and Principles  
(Amendments 14, 91, 42, 21, 22, 1, 2, 15, 16, 43, 118, 119, 44 and 20)**

[5] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, symudwn ymlaen at y grŵp cyntaf, sy'n ymwneud â rheoli cynaliadwy ar adnoddau naturiol ac egwyddorion. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp fydd gwelliant 14 yn enw Russell George. Rwy'n galw ar Russell i gynnig gwelliant 14 a siarad am y gwelliannau eraill. Russell.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** So, we will move on to the first group, which relates to sustainable management of natural resources and principles. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 14 in the name of Russell George. I call on Russell to move amendment 14 and to speak to this amendment and the other amendments in the group. Russell.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 14 (Russell George).  
Amendment 14 (Russell George) moved.*

[6] **Russell George:** Thank you, Chair. Good morning, all. I would like to move amendment 14 and speak to other amendments 15, 16 and 20, which are in my name within this grouping. The intention of this lead amendment and subsequent amendments in this grouping is to ensure that the Bill explicitly recognises the role that landscapes play in natural resources management.

[7] During evidence, the committee felt that the Campaign for the

Protection of Rural Wales and the Alliance for National Parks provided compelling evidence to us in support of the inclusion of the term 'landscapes'. CPRW particularly highlighted how the Bill fails to recognise our cultural values associated with landscapes, and in the important context of integrating the role that they play in land-use management and environmental stewardship. As such, this amendment would extend the definition of 'natural resources' within the sustainable management of natural resources part of the Bill to include landscapes. The amendment in my name ensures that the scope and interest of landscape and seascape issues are properly embedded in the provisions of Part 1 of the Bill. These relate in particular to landscapes being recognised in (1) the overarching definition of natural resources, (2) the scope of the principles of sustainable management of natural resources, and (3) the scope of NRW's purpose and remit.

[8] Embedding these amendments unequivocally on the face of the Bill will ensure that all of the Bill's provisions would give consideration to and recognise the full scope of landscapes in natural resources management, as defined in the European landscape convention. It would also ensure that Natural Resources Wales has a remit for landscape protection in its purpose. I, therefore, hope the Minister will agree with my amendment, and I obviously encourage other Members to support the amendment.

[9] **Alun Ffred Davies:** Diolch yn fawr. Llyr Gruffydd. **Alun Ffred Davies:** Thank you very much. Llyr Gruffydd.

[10] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Thank you, Chair. I'll speak first to the Plaid Cymru amendment, which is number 91, which was of course one that the committee agreed as our recommendation 6 in our Stage 1 report. I trust that all Members will once again support it. It basically calls for replacing the current wording of the objective of sustainable management and natural resources with the resilient Wales goal, as of course has been set out in the Well-being of Future Generations Act. It was recommended because enhancing the link between this Bill and the future generations Act will leave a more coherent legal position for those interpreting and implementing these laws, and given the level of stakeholder support for the resilient Wales goal to replace the objective under section 3(2), committee concluded that this provision should be amended to make the resilient Wales goal the objective. It would also ensure of course, that the general purpose of Natural Resources Wales is to promote the achievement of the objective, namely to maintain and enhance a biodiverse natural environment with healthy functioning



ecosystems that support social, economic and ecological resilience and the capacity to adapt to change, for example climate change, which I believe better reflects the work that Natural Resources Wales needs to do.

[11] I'll be voting against Government amendment 42, which references all the wellbeing goals in this respect. It's too broad a remit, too all-encompassing, in my view. Natural Resources Wales's role should be primarily the achievement of the resilient Wales goal, whilst, of course, still contributing to the other goals in the future generations Act.

[12] As far as the other amendments are concerned, I have to say I'm not convinced of the need to include landscapes. I agree. When the Minister said previously that the Bill's provisions are broad enough to not require an explicit reference. That's not to say I couldn't be persuaded, but, despite the evidence we received, I haven't been as yet, so I won't be supporting that particular series of amendments from Russell George.

[13] Amendment 43—the wording doesn't adequately reflect the precautionary approach needed, in my view, because it doesn't assess the likely levels of risk or harm. I prefer the approach taken in amendment 22 from Bill Powell, which I'm formally supporting. I'm also supporting amendment 21 from Bill Powell and 1, 2 and 44 from the Minister. But, as for 118 and 119 from Janet Haworth, I understand fully the need to uphold a large number of principles in the Bill. You reference food production and tourism in these particular amendments. Well, why stop there? You know, there's a danger that we end up creating a whole shopping list—there are so many other areas, I think, that we could include if we wanted to. I'm not opposed to them, but I think the section risks becoming too long a list, so I'll be abstaining on those.

[14] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. William Powell.

[15] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I've tabled two amendments in this group. Amendment 21 addresses the Environment and Sustainability Committee recommendation number 5 of our report. A large number of organisations that gave oral and written evidence called for definitions of 'biodiversity' and 'ecosystems' that match those found in the UN convention on biological diversity on the face of the Bill. We heard particularly from UKELA, the environmental law association, that the lack of these definitions weakened the Bill, and during evidence sessions it became apparent to me and to other Members that there was a lack of clarity around these

definitions, and particularly around the term ‘ecosystems’. This amendment, together with amendment 92, proposed by Llyr Huws Gruffydd, would provide greater clarity and would prevent the terms being open to wide interpretation, which would be an absolute delight for the legal profession. As we said as a committee, a number of public bodies and stakeholders will have an important role to play in the delivery of this Bill, and it’s really important that we’ve got absolute certainty around what they’re being expected to deliver.

[16] Amendment 22 addresses committee recommendation 7. Biodiversity underpins all ecosystems services. As a committee, we heard from numerous stakeholders about the merit of including both the precautionary principle and making reference to acting, and I quote:

[17] ‘within environmental limits’

[18] and having that on the face of the Bill. These are established principles that are understood internationally, and incorporating them here not only provides additional clarity to underpin the principles of the Bill, but also adds to the consistency with the principles contained in the Well-Being of Future Generations Act. I will not be supporting amendment 42 for the reasons outlined already by Llyr, as I feel that amendment 91 provides greater clarity and would therefore be my preferred option. I will also be voting against amendment 43, as I do not feel that this adequately reflects the precautionary approach as laid out in my amendment. An assessment of the likely levels of risk and harm is important for ensuring that the environment is protected, and ‘harm’ in this respect is not only limited to serious or irreversible damage, as laid out in the Minister’s amendment.

[19] Finally, I will also not be supporting amendments 118 or 119, as, whilst I can understand the sentiment that underlies them, I do not feel that they are necessary for the fulfilment of the Bill.

[20] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Janet Howarth.

[21] **Janet Howarth:** Thank you, Chair. I’m going to speak to amendments 118 and 119, and I’m disappointed that Plaid cannot support these—perhaps I can still persuade you to do so.

[22] The two activities mentioned are major activities: tourism and agriculture, and there is a close relationship between the two. They

encompass a myriad of small and medium-sized businesses as well. They are an integral part of our living and working landscape. These two amendments therefore aim to strengthen the Bill by adding additional principles focusing on food production and tourism, and to ensure that these two sectors are given adequate consideration by Welsh Government Ministers. Tourism is obviously a key industry in Wales, attracting millions of tourists throughout the year. Figures show that 2014 was a record-breaking year, and provisional figures show that the last month we have data for, August, showed a 40 per cent higher turnover than the previous year. We're still in quite a fragile economic state, and a 40 per cent increase in the activity of a business, and a business that is closely related to agriculture, which is also suffering some shocks at the moment, cannot be ignored.

[23] Food production is also a key sector in Wales and needs the additional focus that this Bill would bring to it. In times of security uncertainty—I don't think I need to labour that point—and concerns over food miles as well, and carbon footprint, it is vital that we do all we can to promote and protect our Welsh food producers.

[24] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Does fawr. A oes unrhyw Aelod arall eisiau any other Member wish to speak? siarad? Jenny Rathbone. Jenny Rathbone.

[25] **Jenny Rathbone:** I'm afraid I'm unconvinced by Russell George's arguments to include the word 'landscapes', because I can't see how it wouldn't be used as a stalking horse by those who wish to resist any change to the landscape, even to keep the landscape looking like it was in the era before climate change, and particularly to use it as a way of resisting renewable energy arrays.

[26] I can't understand, really, why amendment 91 is being proposed, because I feel that amendment 42 locks this Bill into the future generations Act as the overarching Act, and therefore I think that it really does emphasise the whole picture coming together.

[27] I'm a great fan of food production locally, and tourism, too, but I don't think that we need to—. Like Llyr, I think we just don't need to be doing lists; I think we absolutely have to be increasing our food production as part of our resilience to climate change, but I don't think we need to say specifically in the Bill that. I think that we've got the future generations Act and this Bill to ensure that we drive that forward.

[28] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you.  
fawr. Y Gweinidog. Minister.

[29] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair, and good morning, committee. Can I start by making a few general remarks, first of all, if I may, in thanking members of the committee and stakeholders who have got us this far in the Bill? It's been an important process in listening to external stakeholders and yourselves to advise us on changes and amendments that we've made to the drafting and, therefore, our amendments that we have laid.

[30] Considering the whole raft of amendments, but speaking to this group, as Members have, can I start with the Government amendments first of all? The Government amendments in this group reflect changes made to the objective and the principles provided at sections 3 and 4 of the Bill, and these are the inclusion of the final element of adaptive management for section 4 of the Bill, adding a new principle in that section.

[31] Amendment 42 responds to recommendation 6, we believe, of the report, and that gives greater clarity with respect to the links between the objectives and the sustainable management of natural resources in section 3 of the Bill and the wellbeing goals of the wellbeing of future generations Act.

9:45

[32] Can I, with some more detail, address some of the amendments that have been raised with Members this morning? First of all, amendment 91. I think it would be fair to say that Llyr and myself have had differing views on this for a long time, but I will be resisting this amendment on the basis that the proposed amendment by Llyr replaces the existing objective provided under section 3 for sustainable management of natural resources with another. I still am surprised by his intent to do this. The intention of Part 1 has always been to ensure that managing our natural resources is more sustainable. This would contribute to all of the seven wellbeing goals, which were supported through the Assembly when we were creating the wellbeing of future generations Act. This is reflected in amendment 42. I would hope that I could convince colleagues to support this amendment because it is a more holistic view on the current legislation that we have in place. Our natural resources support how we achieve our economic, social, cultural and environmental wellbeing. Amendment 91, as proposed by Llyr, would remove this connection. It would significantly limit and weaken the objectives of

sustainable management of natural resources and, as a result, Part 1 in the Bill. I also believe it would limit the application of Part 1 only as being one part of the wellbeing of future generations Act in terms of resilience, and I think therefore that it would weaken the principle of this Bill and not align it, as you've asked me to, to the more holistic view of the other piece of legislation.

[33] Can I move on to some of the other amendments tabled by colleagues? Russell George's amendments 15, 16 and 20 with regard to the wording of 'landscape'—again, we've had many discussions over this, and I do understand the Member's views very well on this. I believe that the inclusion of the term is unnecessary as all of the key elements of landscapes are already covered in the sustainable management of natural resources in the drafting that we have in place. Indeed, I think that to include the word 'landscape' would have a negative effect on the Bill. The definition of 'natural resources' includes only natural components, biotic and abiotic, and it therefore includes all of the natural components of a landscape.

[34] However, amendment 14 by Russell George would mean that the definition would contain both natural and man-made components in a legal definition; therefore, this could include, for example, castles or indeed windfarms, as Jenny alluded to. So, we will be resisting that amendment also.

[35] Finally, amendments 118 and 119 again seek to include additional principles in section 4, relating to the importance of food production and tourism respectively. I agree with the Member in terms that they are very important sectors within our rural and urban economies; however, we believe that these are already covered and actually risk other areas being not listed in the Bill. So, we would resist that also. I would like Members' consideration to support the Government amendments today.

[36] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Russell George i ymateb. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Russell George to respond.

[37] **Russell George:** Thank you, Chair. The Minister has stated that the Bill's provisions are broad enough, in his view, to allow it to not apply to landscapes, but I would still contend. I have the view that landscapes are not adequately dealt with in the scope of the proposed ecosystems approach. The Minister has certainly yet to convince me or give me any assurances that landscapes will be addressed in the term 'ecosystems'. A definition of 'ecosystems' has not been provided on the face of the Bill. I am, of course,

disappointed that other Members have indicated that they won't support these amendments. To me, it's just a key role that landscapes play in providing an overarching framework for the implementation of natural resources management. If that's not on the face of the Bill—it's a shame that it's been overlooked, in my view.

[38] I hear other Members' comments. The Minister talked about castles and windfarms. That's fine. Jenny Rathbone talked about renewable energy. Perhaps you got the speaking notes wrong, but certainly there was no reference to renewable energy in my amendments; and in what I said, there was no mention of renewable energy either. So, I'm disappointed by those comments particularly, as well.

[39] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Reit. Diolch yn fawr. Russell, a ydych chi eisiau symud i bleidlais? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Right. Thank you very much. Russell, do you wish to proceed to a vote?

[40] **Russell George:** Move.

[41] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 14? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] lawn. Felly, symudwn i bleidlais drwy ddangos dwylo. Y rhai sydd o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Ac yn erbyn. Ymatal? Na. Felly, o blaid, tri, yn erbyn, saith. Felly mae'r gwelliant hwnnw wedi methu. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 14 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] Very well, we will move to a vote by show of hands. Those in favour to raise their hands please. And against. Abstentions? No. So, in favour, three, against, seven. So, that amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 14: O blaid 3, Yn erbyn 7, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 14: For 3, Against 7, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet  
Powell, William

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 14.*  
*Amendment 14 not agreed.*

[42] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 91? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 91?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 91 (Llyr Gruffydd).*  
*Amendment 91 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[43] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

[44] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 91? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Iawn. Felly, fe gawn ni bleidlais drwy ddangos dwylo ar welliant 91. Y rheini o blaid i godi eu dwylo. Ac yn erbyn. Ar bleidlais fwrw'r Cadeirydd, rwy'n gorfod bwrw pleidlais negyddol, felly, mae'r gwelliant hwnnw wedi'i golli. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 91 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] So, we will have a vote by show of hands on amendment 91. All those in favour, raise their hands. And against. So, the Chair's casting vote, I have to vote in the negative, and so that amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 91: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*  
*Amendment 91: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Haworth, Janet Powell, William Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred	Antoniw, Mick Cuthbert, Jeff Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*  
*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 91.*  
*Amendment 91 not agreed.*

[45] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, **Alun Ffred Jones:** We move on to symudwn ymlaen i welliant 42 yn amendment 42 in the name of the enw'r Gweinidog. Minister.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 42 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 42 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[46] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes, please. Formally.

[47] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A ddylid **Alun Ffred Jones:** Should amendment derbyn gwelliant 42? Unrhyw 42 be agreed? Any objection? wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] [*Objection.*] So, we will have a vote by Felly, ceir pleidlais drwy ddangos show of hands. Will those in favour of dwylo. Y rheini o blaid gwelliant 42. amendment 42 show that? And Ac yn erbyn. Felly, mae'r gwelliant against. So, the amendment is agreed wedi'i dderbyn o saith i dri. by seven to three.

*Gwelliant 42: O blaid 7, Yn erbyn 3, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 42: For 7, Against 3, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:

Antoniw, Mick	Gruffydd, Llyr
Cuthbert, Jeff	Jones, Alun Ffred
George, Russell	Powell, William
Haworth, Janet	
Morgan, Julie	
Rathbone, Jenny	
Watson, Joyce	

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 42.  
Amendment 42 agreed.*

[48] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant wish to move amendment 21? 21?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 21 (William Powell, gyda chefnogaeth Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 21 (William Powell, supported by Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[49] **William Powell:** Move.



[50] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 21? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] lawn. Felly, pleidlais drwy ddangos dwylo. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 21, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal. Felly, rwy'n bwrw'r bleidlais yn erbyn ac felly mae'r gwelliant hwnnw wedi'i golli.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 21 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] So, we will have a vote by show of hands. All those in favour of amendment 21, please. And against. That's tied. So, I use my casting vote in the negative and so the amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 21: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 21: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet  
Powell, William  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).  
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 21.  
Amendment 21 not agreed.*

[51] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 22, William. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Amendment 22, William.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 22 (William Powell, gyda chefnogaeth Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 22 (William Powell, supported by Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[52] **William Powell:** Move.

[53] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 22? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 22 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] So, we will

[*Gwrthwynebiad.*] lawn. Felly, ceir have a vote. All those in favour of pleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant amendment 22 to show that please. 22 i ddangos hynny os gwelwch yn And against. It's a tied vote, so I use dda. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal. my casting vote as Chair in the Rwy'n bwrw pleidlais y Cadeirydd yn negative, and so the amendment is erbyn. Felly, mae'r gwelliant hwnnw not agreed. wedi'i golli.

*Gwelliant 22: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 22: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Haworth, Janet Powell, William Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred	Antoniw, Mick Cuthbert, Jeff Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 22.  
Amendment 22 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 1 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 1 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[54] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 1 yn enw'r Gweinidog. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 1 in the name of the Minister.

[55] **Carl Sargeant:** Formally.

[56] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Sori, fi sy'n— . A ddylid derbyn gwelliant 1? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad, felly mae gwelliant 1 wedi'i dderbyn. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Sorry, it's me—. Should amendment 1 be agreed? Any objection? No objection, so amendment 1 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 1 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 1 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 2 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 2 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[57] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 2 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 2? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad, felly mae'r gwelliant wedi'i dderbyn.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 2 in the name of the Minister. The question is: should the amendment be agreed? Is there any objection? There's no objection, therefore the amendment is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 2 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 2 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[58] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, gwelliant 15.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, do you wish to move amendment 15?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 15 (Russell George).*

*Amendment 15 (Russell George) moved.*

[59] **Russell George:** Move.

[60] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad i welliant 15? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Felly, ceir pleidlais drwy ddangos dwylo. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 15 os gwelwch yn dda. Tri. Yn erbyn, chwech. Rwyf yn ymatal. Felly, mae'r gwelliant hwnnw wedi methu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Is there any objection to amendment 15? [Objection.] There is objection, so we will have a vote by show of hands. All those in favour of amendment 15, please show that. Three. And against, six. I abstain. So, that amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 15: O blaid 3, Yn erbyn 6, Ymatal 1.*

*Amendment 15: For 3, Against 6, Abstain 1.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Morgan, Julie

Jones, Alun Ffred

Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 15.*  
*Amendment 15 not agreed.*

[61] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell,  
gwelliant 16. amendment 16.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 16 (Russell George).*  
*Amendment 16 (Russell George) moved.*

[62] **Russell George:** Move.

[63] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that  
yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 16? amendment 16 be agreed. Any  
Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? objection? [*Objection.*] So, we will  
[*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Pleidlais. Pawb have a vote. All those in favour of  
sydd o blaid gwelliant 16 i ddangos amendment 16 to show that. Three.  
hynny. Tri. Yn erbyn, chwech. Rwyf And against, six. I abstain. So, the  
yn ymatal. Felly, mae'r gwelliant amendment is not agreed.  
hwnnw wedi methu.

*Gwelliant 16: O blaid 3, Yn erbyn 6, Ymatal 1.*  
*Amendment 16: For 3, Against 6, Abstain 1.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

Jones, Alun Ffred

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 16.*  
*Amendment 16 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 43 (Carl Sargeant).*  
*Amendment 43 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[64] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 43 **Alun Ffred Jones:** Amendment 43 in

yn enw'r Gweinidog. Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 43. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Gwrthwynebiad. Felly, pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 43, os gwelwch yn dda. Saith. Ac yn erbyn, tri. Felly, mae'r gwelliant wedi'i dderbyn.

the name of the Minister. I move amendment 43. Is there any objection? [Objection.] So, we will have a vote. Will all those in favour of amendment 43 show that please? Seven. And against, three. So, that amendment is agreed.

*Gwelliant 43: O blaid 7, Yn erbyn 3, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 43: For 7, Against 3, Abstain 0.*

O	blaid:	Yn	erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:		Against:		Abstain:
Antoniw,	Mick	Gruffydd,		Llyr
Cuthbert,	Jeff	Jones,	Alun	Ffred
George,	Russell	Powell,		William
Haworth,	Janet			
Morgan,	Julie			
Rathbone,	Jenny			
Watson, Joyce				

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 42.  
Amendment 42 agreed.*

[65] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, amendment gwelliant 118. 118.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 118 (Janet Haworth).  
Amendment 118 (Janet Haworth) moved.*

[66] **Janet Haworth:** I move, yes.

[67] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 118? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Pleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid 118. Dau. Yn erbyn, chwech. Ac ymatal, dau. Felly, mae'r gwelliant wedi methu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 118 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [Objection.] So, we'll have a vote. All those in favour of 118. Two. Against, six. There are two abstentions. So, the amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 118: O blaid 2, Yn erbyn 6, Ymatal 2.  
Amendment 118: For 2, Against 6, Abstain 2.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Powell, William  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 118.  
Amendment 118 not agreed.*

[68] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, amendment  
gwelliant 119. 119.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 119 (Janet Haworth).  
Amendment 119 (Janet Haworth) moved.*

[69] **Janet Haworth:** I move.

[70] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw **Alun Ffred Jones:** Any objection?  
wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] [*Objection.*] So, we'll move to a vote.  
Felly, symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o All those in favour of amendment  
blaid gwelliant 119 i ddangos hynny. 119 to show that, please. Against,  
Yn erbyn, chwech. Ymatal, dau. Felly, six. Two abstentions. So, the  
mae'r gwelliant wedi methu. amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 119: O blaid 2, Yn erbyn 6, Ymatal 2.  
Amendment 119: For 2, Against 6, Abstain 2.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Powell, William  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 119.  
Amendment 119 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 44 (Carl Sargeant).*  
*Amendment 44 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[71] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment gwelliant 44 yn enw'r Gweinidog. 44 in the name of the Minister. Is Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim there any objection? There is no gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 44 objection. Amendment 44 is agreed. wedi ei dderbyn. Diolch yn fawr. Thank you very much.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 44 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*  
*Amendment 44 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

**Grŵp 2: Biomrywiaeth (Gwelliannau 92, 79, 93, 94, 95, 96, 80, 97, 81, 3, 23, 24, 26, 99, 82, 28, 102 a 104)**  
**Group 2: Biodiversity (Amendments 92, 79, 93, 94, 95, 96, 80, 97, 81, 3, 23, 24, 26, 99, 82, 28, 102 and 104)**

[72] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Reit, rydym **Alun Ffred Jones:** Right, we'll move ni'n symud ymlaen at grŵp 2, sydd on to group 2, which relates to yn ymwneud â bioamrywiaeth. Y prif biodiversity. The lead amendment in welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 92 yn the group is amendment 92 in the enw Llyr Gruffydd. Galwaf ar Llyr i name of Llyr Gruffydd. I call on Llyr gynnis gwelliant 92 a siarad am y to move amendment 92 and to speak gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp. Diolch to the amendments in the group. yn fawr. Thank you.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 92 (Llyr Gruffydd).*  
*Amendment 92 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[73] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I have nine amendments in this group, the first of which, and the lead amendment, is, of course, 92. It's based on committee recommendation 4 from our Stage 1 report, and it is:

[74] 'to insert the UN Convention's definition of "biological diversity" as the definition of "biodiversity"

[75] in the Bill. The Minister's stated in evidence to the committee that the term 'biodiversity' has the meaning provided under the UN convention, so I think, given that we had advice and evidence from organisations such as the UK Environment Law Association warning that 'biodiversity' is a complex

term that is open to wide interpretation, the easy answer is to set that out clearly on the face of the Bill, so that we avoid any confusion or, indeed, any need to refer back to the proceedings of this committee.

[76] Amendment 93 is based on the committee's fifteenth recommendation in our Stage 1 report to require public bodies to carry out the biodiversity duty under section 6 with reference to the biodiversity list, established, of course, under section 7. Stakeholders told the committee that creating links between sections 6 and 7 would create a meaningful reporting structure that would allow progress to be monitored alongside any broader indicators being developed under the future generations Act. Embedding the biodiversity list in section 7 into the actions to be taken under the national natural resources policy and area statements will offer real clarity to those placed under the duty to be established by section 6. Ultimately, I believe that linking the list in section 7 with the delivery mechanisms to be established by the Bill will provide a meaningful framework that has the potential to deliver real outcomes for biodiversity in Wales. Without these links, of course, section 7 stands somewhat on its own, and the link between the section 6 duty and the rest of Part 1 is unclear. Making these links will assist in delivering, I believe, the Welsh Government's aspirations for the Bill. This amendment is linked to amendments 95, 97, 99, 102, 103 and 104.

[77] Amendment 94. When a public authority publishes its report on what it's done to comply with the biodiversity and resilience of ecosystems duty in section 6, my amendment 94 seeks to ensure that it should also include any action that it considers necessary to improve compliance with the duty in that subsection. So, as well as reporting on the action it has taken to comply with its biodiversity duty, a public authority also needs to consider the effectiveness of its actions, and I think that would enrich the process greatly. It's important, in my view, that the public bodies consider whether the approaches that they have taken can be improved in order to better fulfil their duty under subsection (1).

[78] Amendment 96 is also based on a committee recommendation—recommendation 14—in our Stage 1 report:

[79] 'that the guidance issued by Ministers on the reporting requirements should contain additional information on the activities that public bodies will be expected to undertake to demonstrate compliance with the duty.'

[80] This was recommended, of course, because stakeholders have called



for greater clarity on what should be included in public authorities' reports on what they have done to comply with the biodiversity duty. The Minister has said that the Welsh Government will issue guidance to public authorities outlining the relevant information to be included in this report, but there isn't a requirement in the Bill for the Welsh Ministers to provide guidance in future, and I believe there should be.

10:00

[81] I'll be voting against those amendments relating to statutory biodiversity targets. I have to say that I haven't been persuaded of the need for such targets, and the danger is, of course, if there is a problem, that we seem to be, as an Assembly, starting to think that maybe statutory targets are some sort of golden bullet. It was referred to in the Chamber yesterday. There's a danger that we think that creating targets is enough. It's not. Clearly, there needs to be a lot of work behind that, and I think that this Bill has the potential to put that framework in place that can better serve, promote and restore biodiversity before—maybe even at a later stage—we might want to consider introducing statutory targets.

[82] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very fawr. Galwaf ar William Powell i much. I call on William Powell to siarad. speak.

[83] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I've tabled several amendments within this group. I'll come first to amendments 23, 24 and 26, which seek to insert a statutory biodiversity target onto the face of the Bill, and also to ensure that there's a duty to act if biodiversity is in decline. My arguments on this will by now be familiar. Existing targets on biodiversity have consistently been missed. The EU biodiversity 2020 strategy is halfway through its implementation period, and yet ecosystems across Europe, including Wales, continue to be degraded, and Wales has international biodiversity commitments that we must uphold. Wales has failed under the UN convention on biodiversity in this regard. As Professor Lawton has said, there is, and I quote,

[84] 'no surrogate metric that can reliably assess conservation success or failure'.

[85] I maintain that Wales's biodiversity levels will be a key indicator of whether the new natural resources approach is actually working. For all of

these reasons, I maintain that we should have statutory biodiversity targets, and on the face of this Bill. However, I understand that the Minister has been consistent in resisting targets of this kind, and for that reason, I've tabled support for several of Llyr Gruffydd's amendments, namely 93, 95, 97, 99, 102 and 104, which are in line with the committee's recommendation 15 on strengthening the biodiversity duty within this Bill. I believe that these provide a robust alternative to having a target, by providing a framework for assessing progress and setting actions. In the event that you're unable to support my amendments in this group today, I would urge you to support those proposed by Llyr Gruffydd.

[86] In relation to amendment 79, the current wording does not, in my view, refer to biodiversity sufficiently, and the resilience of ecosystems equally. Therefore, it appears to make the resilience of ecosystems the desired outcome of maintaining and enhancing biodiversity. The amendment seeks to make it clearer that positive outcomes for biodiversity are also sought under this specific duty.

[87] In terms of amendment 80, this amendment seeks to ensure that Welsh Ministers engage with the relevant stakeholders when developing the criteria that are to be used to develop the biodiversity list under section 7 of the Bill. The existing list is based on endangered species, and the Bill should, in my view, make it clear that the basis upon which the criteria are used to form that list cannot be changed without consulting the relevant interested parties.

[88] Amendment 81 seeks to ensure transparency around the advice, and responses to that advice, in relation to the development of the biodiversity list. The Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 rightly requires Welsh Ministers and public bodies to publish their responses to advice received from the future generations commissioner, and I think that this could and should be mirrored here. The accessibility of evidence and information early on in the process of compiling this list is essential, and it's important not only for ensuring that relevant bodies have access to that information, but also important for the purposes of transparency, and to restate the independence, which is absolutely critical, of NRW.

[89] Amendment 82 aims to require that the state of natural resources report refers to the framework of milestones and indicators that are being established under the well-being of future generations Act. A number of the milestones and indicators being developed will be directly relevant to the

sustainable management of natural resources, particularly those relating to healthy ecosystems and a biodiverse natural environment. It also makes perfect sense, therefore, to link them in this way. Furthermore, this also has relevance to NRW being able to assess the extent to which sustainable management of natural resources is, in fact, being achieved.

[90] Similarly, amendment 28 sets out that Ministers would have to identify the increase in the national biodiversity index that they will aim to achieve in the period before the next report, and the actions required to maintain and enhance biodiversity. Again, this is about ensuring concrete action and progress towards the vital target of increasing biodiversity. I will be supporting all the other amendments in this group. Diolch yn fawr.

[91] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Janet Haworth.

[92] **Janet Haworth:** Thank you, Chair. My colleagues here on the right have made compelling arguments in favour of the amendments they have tabled. The scientific evidence is very clear that, here in Wales, we are steadily losing habitats and a point will eventually be reached where we cannot restore those lost habitats. So, now is the time to act and make timely interventions. I think these amendments have been bravely tabled and we will be supporting them.

[93] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. A oes Aelod arall sydd eisiau any other Member wish to speak? No. I call on the Minister—Carl.

[94] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. The Government amendments in this group directly addresses the committee recommendation 10 and the call from stakeholders to strengthen the language in certain sections of the Bill, and we believe we've done that by Government amendment 3 and I would ask you to formally move that, as appropriate.

[95] Can I pick up the points that Members have raised with regard to their contributions just now? First of all, if I may take amendment 92, tabled by Llyr Gruffydd, which seeks to include the UN Convention on Biological Diversity—the UN CBD—definition in Part 1 of the Bill. Again, I don't think we're a million miles away in terms of what we're trying to seek here, but the concern I have, if I were to support this amendment, is the clarity of this. In particular, the amendment requires the reader to look up the definition itself

and this would not improve accessibility to this legislation. Furthermore, of more concern, if the definition provided by the UN CBD is amended from time to time, it means that the Welsh law would be bound by the decisions of somebody else in the international community and would have a direct effect on Welsh law.

[96] There is a risk, therefore, that any amendments to the UN definition in future may not be suitable for application in Wales, or that the definition is unclear or unworkable in the context of Welsh law. Therefore, I don't believe that it should be directly linked as that. However, I also understand that the Member is seeking to have clarity about biodiversity, and if we are to pursue that, it should be the definition sitting on the face of the Bill, directly, as opposed to a link to another element of legislation. I will give that further consideration at Stage 3 in terms of the appropriateness of that, but I won't be seeking to support that amendment today. I'd ask the committee to reject that.

[97] Amendment 79, tabled by William Powell, would insert 'promoting biodiversity' in section 6 in addition to the duty to promote the resilience of ecosystems. The effect of amendment 79 is that public authorities will be required to maintain and enhance biodiversity and, in doing so, promote biodiversity. This creates a duplication of the requirement as both 'promoting' and 'enhancing', we believe, mean the same thing. This amendment neither strengthens this duty, in our view, nor does it provide clarity on how the duty is to be applied by public authorities and may result in some confusion. We think there's an issue around drafting, and again, I'd urge Members to reconsider this amendment and reject it at this stage.

[98] Amendment 93 would include provision for public authorities to take account of the section 7 list when complying with their duty under section 6. Again, I agree with the principles of this amendment. However, this approach could limit the extent of the biodiversity duty under section 6 of the Bill, by placing a focus on only specific species or habitats that are covered by the list. This, I believe, is against the intent of the Bill as a whole to go beyond nature conservation and apply an approach that recognises the importance of all of our natural resources and how they interact with one another. We believe that this amendment would be prohibitive in this instance. Therefore, we won't be seeking to support it. In addition to that, Chair, I think it is important just to clarify that priority species are covered already by other legal requirements and the Bill will not alter, in any way, those provisions in other aspects. But we don't believe amendment 94 is appropriate; it's more

limiting than what we currently have.

[99] Similarly to amendment 94, which is directly linked, amendment 95 would insert a new requirement on Welsh Ministers, in meeting their reporting requirement under the duty under section 6 for maintaining and enhancing biodiversity, to have regard to the most recent publication of SoNaRR and the national indicators and milestones under the well-being of future generations Act—directly linked to 94. Whilst, again, I agree with the principle behind the amendment, it merely duplicates the requirements on the Welsh Ministers under section 9. We have to look at the whole Bill in terms of the appropriateness of reporting. It duplicates the requirements on Welsh Ministers under section 9 of the national natural resources policy—NNRP—in which they will set down the steps needed in relation to biodiversity as tabled by amendment 48. Amendment 48 will be discussed as part of a later group, but, as I said, Chair, this has to be, we believe, taken as a whole in terms of the reporting and how it interacts not only with this Bill, but also the other aspects of reporting legislation, including the well-being of future generations Act.

[100] As I said, I will consider some of the amendments tabled in the spirit that Members have tabled them today. I do believe that we're not a million miles away in terms of what you're trying to seek to do, but given the current drafting of these amendments by opposition Members, I won't be in a place to support them today. But I will consider them at Stage 3.

[101] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Llyr i ymateb i'r ddadl. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Llyr to respond to the debate.

[102] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Thank you, Chair. I'll just start by referring to the biodiversity targets—the statutory targets. I think Bill Powell is quite right to highlight the fact that we are missing targets, but I'm not sure that creating more targets necessarily is the answer. What we need to be doing is actually—what we need is more action and not more targets. Now, I can understand how targets can drive cultural change, as we've seen with waste and, hopefully, with climate change, but I think there's much more we can do in terms of improving biodiversity in Wales before we, maybe—or before I, certainly, feel that we maybe need to create that statutory imperative, if you like, in terms of biodiversity.

[103] I'll be supporting your amendment 81, Bill, on biodiversity lists, because I think it's quite right, for example, that the reason why each

organism and habitat is on the list is clearly expressed and articulated.

[104] With regard to amendment 79, Minister, I think you said that ‘promoting’ and ‘enhancing’ are the same thing. I would disagree. I think you can promote something without necessarily enhancing it. I think, to enhance something, there’s more of a compulsion, and you need to be a bit more proactive in that respect, so I’ll be supporting amendment 79.

[105] With regard to amendment 92 and the definition of biodiversity, of course, you were the one who told us that it was the UN convention’s definition, so, you know, my amendments sought to put that in the Bill. I hear what you’re saying, so I look forward to maybe doing something around that at Stage 3. Thank you.

[106] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn, diolch yn fawr. Felly, fe wnawn ni symud i bleidlais ar y gwelliannau. Llyr, y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant—wyt ti eisiau—?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Fine, thank you very much. So, we will proceed to a vote on the amendments. Llyr, the question is that amendment—do you wish to—?

[107] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

[108] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynnig. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 92? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, pleidlais os gwelwch yn dda. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 92 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Pump. Yn erbyn. Cyfartal, felly rwy’n bwrw pleidlais y Cadeirydd yn erbyn. Felly, mae’r gwelliant wedi methu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Move. The question is that amendment 92 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] So, we will have a vote, please. Will all those in favour of amendment 92 show, please? Five. Against. It’s tied, so I use my casting vote as Chair in the negative. Therefore, the amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 92: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 92: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie

Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 92.*

*Amendment 92 not agreed.*

[109] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant wish to move amendment 79? 79?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 79 (William Powell).*

*Amendment 79 (William Powell) moved.*

[110] **William Powell:** Cynnig.

**William Powell:** I move.

[111] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 79? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 79 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Pump. Yn erbyn. Pump. Pleidlais gyfartal. Rwy'n bwrw'r bleidlais fwrw yn erbyn, felly mae'r gwelliant yn methu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 79 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] So, we'll proceed to a vote. Will all those in favour of amendment 79 show that, please? Five. Against. Five. There's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative, so the amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 79: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 79: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais*

*fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 79.*

*Amendment 79 not agreed.*

[112] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 93?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 93?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 93 (Llyr Gruffydd).*

*Amendment 93 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[113] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[114] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 93? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 93 i ddangos. Yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Rwy'n bwrw'r bleidlais yn erbyn, fel Cadeirydd. Felly mae'r gwelliant wedi methu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 93 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] So, we'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 93 to show? Against. That is tied. I use my casting vote in the negative, as Chair. So, the amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 93: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 93: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*



*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 93.*  
*Amendment 93 not agreed.*

[115] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 94, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Amendment 94,  
Llyr. Llyr.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 94 (Llyr Gruffydd).*  
*Amendment 94 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[116] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[117] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that  
yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 94? amendment 94 be agreed. Does any  
Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Member object? [*Objection.*] So, we'll  
[*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. proceed to a vote. All those in favour  
Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 94 i of amendment 94 to show, please.  
ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Pump. Five. And those against. Five. It's a  
Ac yn erbyn. Pump. Mae'n gyfartal. tied vote. I use my casting vote  
Rwy'n bwrw fy mhleidlais fwrw yn against the amendment, so the  
erbyn y gwelliant, felly mae'r amendment falls.  
gwelliant wedi methu.

10:15

*Gwelliant 94: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*  
*Amendment 94: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:
George, Russell	Antoniw, Mick	
Gruffydd, Llyr	Cuthbert, Jeff	
Haworth, Janet	Morgan, Julie	
Jones, Alun Ffred	Rathbone, Jenny	
Powell, William	Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais  
fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in  
accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 94.*

*Amendment 94 not agreed.*

[118] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 95? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 95?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 95 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 95 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[119] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[120] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 95. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 95 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Pump. Ac yn erbyn. Pump. Pleidlais gyfartal. Felly, rwy'n bwrw fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn y gwelliant, ac mae felly yn methu. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 95 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] So, we'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 95 to show, please. Five. And against. Five. It's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative, and the amendment therefore falls.

*Gwelliant 95: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 95: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O For:	blaid: Against:	Yn Against:	erbyn: Abstain:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Gruffydd, Haworth, Jones, Alun Powell, William	Russell Llyr Janet Ffred	Antoniw, Cuthbert, Morgan, Rathbone, Watson, Joyce	Mick Jeff Julie Jenny	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 95.  
Amendment 95 not agreed.*

[121] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment

gwelliant 96.

96.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 96 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 96 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[122] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[123] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 96. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 96 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn mynd yn erbyn y gwelliant, felly mae'n methu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 96 be agreed to. Any objections? [*Objection.*] So, we'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 96 to show, please. And against. It's tied. The casting vote goes in the negative, and the amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 96: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 96: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 96.  
Amendment 96 not agreed.*

[124] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, gwelliant 80. amendment 80.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 80 (William Powell).  
Amendment 80 (William Powell) moved.*

[125] **William Powell:** Cynnig.

**William Powell:** I move.

[126] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 80. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 80 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal. Felly, rwy'n bwrw fy mhleidlais fwrw yn erbyn, felly mae'r gwelliant yn syrthio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. The question is that amendment 80 be agreed. Any objections? [*Objection.*] So, we'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 80 to show. And against. It's tied. So, I use my casting vote in the negative, and the amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 80: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 80: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:

Yn erbyn:

Ymatal:

For:

Against:

Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 80.*

*Amendment 80 not agreed.*

[127] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 97.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment 97.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 97 (Llyr Gruffydd).*

*Amendment 97 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[128] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[129] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that

Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 97 i ddangos. Diolch yn fawr. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal. Felly, mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn mynd yn erbyn y gwelliant, felly mae'n syrthio.

amendment 97 be agreed to. Any objections? [*Objection.*] So, we'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 97 to show. Thank you very much. And against. It's tied. So, the casting vote is in the negative, and the amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 97: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 97: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Haworth, Janet Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William	Antoniw, Mick Cuthbert, Jeff Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).  
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 97.  
Amendment 97 not agreed.*

[130] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, Alun Ffred Jones: William, gwelliant 81. amendment 81.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 81 (William Powell).  
Amendment 81 (William Powell) moved.*

[131] **William Powell:** Cynnig. **William Powell:** I move.

[132] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant amendment 81 be agreed. Any objections? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 81. Thank you very

81. Diolch yn fawr. Ac yn erbyn. much. And against. It's tied. I use my Mae'n gyfartal. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw casting vote in the negative, so yn mynd yn erbyn, felly mae gwelliant amendment 81 falls. 81 yn methu.

*Gwelliant 81: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 81: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:
George, Russell	Antoniw, Mick	
Gruffydd, Llyr	Cuthbert, Jeff	
Haworth, Janet	Morgan, Julie	
Jones, Alun Ffred	Rathbone, Jenny	
Powell, William	Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).  
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 81.  
Amendment 81 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 3 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 3 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[133] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment gwelliant 3 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y 3 in the name of the Minister. The cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn question is that amendment 3 be gwelliant 3? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? agreed. Any objection? There's no Dim gwrthwynebiad. Felly, mae'r objection. So, the amendment is gwelliant yn pasio. agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 3 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 3 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[134] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, gwelliant 23. amendment 23.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 23 (William Powell).*

*Amendment 23 (William Powell) moved.*

[135] **William Powell:** Cynnig. **William Powell:** I move.

[136] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Os na dderbynnir gwelliant 23, bydd gwelliant 26 yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 23? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 23 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'r gwelliant yn methu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** If amendment 23 is not agreed, amendment 26 will fall. The question is that amendment 23 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 23 to show. And against. The amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 23: O blaid 4, Yn erbyn 6, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 23: For 4, Against 6, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 23.*

*Amendment 23 not agreed.*

*Methodd gwelliant 26.*

*Amendment 26 fell.*

[137] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, dyna'r grŵp yna wedi ei gwblhau. **Alun Ffred Jones:** So, we've completed that group.

**Grŵp 3: Adroddiad ar Gyflwr Adnoddau Naturiol (Gwelliannau 120, 17, 25, 98, 45, 46, 100, 56, 57 a 78)**

**Group 3: State of Natural Resources Report (Amendments 120, 17, 25, 98, 45, 46, 100, 56, 57 and 78)**

[138] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symudwn **Alun Ffred Jones:** We proceed to

ymlaen at grŵp 3, sy'n ymwneud â'r group 3, which relates to the state of adroddiad ar gyflwr adnoddau natural resources report. The lead naturiol. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw amendment in the group is gwelliant 120 yn enw Janet Haworth, amendment 120 in the name of Janet ac rwy'n galw ar Janet i siarad am ei Haworth, and I call on Janet to speak gwelliant a'r gwelliannau eraill yn y to her amendment and the other grŵp. Janet Haworth. amendments in this group. Janet Haworth.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 120 (Janet Haworth).*

*Amendment 120 (Janet Haworth) moved.*

[139] **Janet Haworth:** Thank you, Chair. I have tabled 120 with the purpose of providing further strength for the role of Natural Resources Wales. NRW has a multitude of roles to undertake, and to do this effectively, it must have the powers and the teeth to do so. Adding the additional words, 'Subject to its capacity to do so', should help to ensure that, if NRW are not adequately resourced, thus putting their capacity to fulfil their role at risk, then they cannot be held responsible for failing to achieve.

[140] Further to the amendment tabled in my name, I support the other amendments tabled within this group.

[141] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr, Janet. Russell i siarad. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much, Janet. Russell to speak.

[142] **Russell George:** Thank you. I speak to amendment 17 in my name in this grouping, and, further to my earlier remarks, the rationale behind this amendment is to ensure that landscapes are adequately reflected in the report that NRW prepares to assess the state of natural resources and the extent to which sustainable management of natural resources is being achieved.

[143] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr, Russell. Galwaf ar William Powell. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much, Russell. I call on William Powell.

[144] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I speak to amendment 25 in this particular group. As a committee, collectively, we recommended that the state of natural resources report include an assessment of past and future trends in addition to an assessment of the current state of natural resources.



The consideration of past data allows predictive data to be generated, and this can be useful for anticipating future issues surrounding natural resource management. It's precisely that that this amendment seeks to facilitate.

[145] I don't feel able to support amendment 120, as the state of natural resources report is absolutely fundamental to the new approach outlined in the Bill, but I do appreciate the importance of NRW having sufficient capacity to deliver on this, and the matter of NRW's capacity and the resources available to it as a body does get raised on a regular basis. So, I do understand and empathise with the reasoning behind the amendment. I'll also be voting against amendment 46. I understand that the intention to publish or at least to make available a draft report is probably there, but I feel that this needs to be made explicit here, otherwise it fails to reflect a transparent engagement, and transparency is really, really important. This has the potential to undermine the vital independence of NRW and its evidence base.

[146] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Llyr Gruffydd i siarad. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Llyr Gruffydd to speak.

[147] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Thank you, Chair. I fully concur, of course, with the concerns about the capacity of Natural Resources Wales. It's something I've raised on a number of occasions, but I think it's wholly inappropriate to have that on the face of the Bill. We should be legislating for a purpose. We can't leave it to the whim of organisational capacity as to whether laws that we create here are actually implemented, so I fear that I'll be voting against amendment 120.

[148] Now, the SoNaRR, of course, is important to the effective functioning of the Bill. It'll provide evidence and assessment of progress with regard to the sustainable management of natural resources for the Welsh Government, for the future generations commissioner, and for public bodies as well. So, its robustness and independence is of course vital. Now, in the state of natural resources report, NRW in fact will be assessing its own effectiveness in fulfilling its purpose, and also, of course, the effectiveness of the Welsh Government's national natural resources policy. I think there's a danger this could be perceived as a conflict of interest, so, to guard against any such concerns, my amendment, which is amendment 100, which reads that:

[149] 'The Welsh Ministers may not issue guidance or directions to NRW in relation to the content of reports prepared under this section',

[150] hopefully will ensure the independence of the report in the same way, I have to say, as the Government is proposing in Part 2, section 47, in relation to the climate change advisory body, where the Bill currently states that the Welsh Ministers may not give the climate change advisory body guidance as to the contents of any advice or report.

[151] My amendment 98, then, aims to require the SoNaRR to provide a more meaningful and results-focused framework of monitoring and reporting on the achievement of sustainable management of natural resources, not only what action's taken, but what further actions are required. I think that's a very, very important focus as we, hopefully, move forward. I won't be supporting Government amendment 46, requiring NRW to provide a draft of the SoNaRR report to the Minister a year before its publication. I understand the Government has a rationale behind that, but it seems to me to be undermining the independence of NRW—on the face of it at least. Of course, it could also mean that the final report is potentially based on two-year-old evidence. So, I'd like the Government maybe to address that, but, as things stand, I won't be supporting amendment 46.

[152] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. A oes Aelodau eraill i siarad? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Are there any other Members who wish to speak?  
Jenny Rathbone. Jenny Rathbone.

[153] **Jenny Rathbone:** I agree with Llyr Gruffydd that amendment 120 is entirely inappropriate, because it's up to us to ensure that, whatever legislation we pass, we have the resources to do the job. So, I will be voting against that. But I have some anxieties about us requiring Natural Resources Wales to do a huge amount of work on future trends given the complexity of some of the work on the way in which climate change is going to change our environment. I think we need to be cautious in the way we lock them into having to produce future trends that may be more appropriately provided by international bodies. Clearly, we have to ensure that Natural Resources Wales is following the plot in understanding how those future trends might impact on the particulars of Wales, but I just think we need to be cautious in the language you use in locking them in to doing something that we, as a small country, might not be capable of delivering on.

[154] **Alun Ffred Jones:** lawn. A oes arall eisiau siarad? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Right. Does anyone else wish to speak? The Minister to speak.  
Gweinidog i siarad, felly.

[155] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I'd like to formally move appropriately the Government amendments as and when. Amendment 45 clarifies that, from the second state of natural resources report onwards, NRW will publish, and need to publish, its report before the end of the calendar year preceding the year of an Assembly election. It's just a clarification amendment.

[156] Amendment 46 requires NRW to provide a draft version of the SoNaRR 12 months prior to its publication. I know that Members have raised concerns about this. I was quite surprised about the interest around this amendment, because, actually, we brought this forward to provide the publication, as required under subsection (3). I brought this amendment forward with the aim of improving the transparency and to support NRW's engagement process in developing a report. So, I find it rather odd that we don't want transparency and a report being brought forward in order for people to understand what they're doing. So, I find that interesting. If it's a drafting issue, then I'd be happy to talk to Members outside of this forum for a Stage 3 amendment, but I think we could work something through there. I'm actually offering up here in terms of an additional report. If Members don't want it, I'm not going to push it too hard.

[157] In terms of the other elements of amendments as tabled, I won't be supporting Janet's 120. The SoNaRR report isn't optional; it's an essential part of this Act and Bill, and it's something that stakeholders are very keen to understand about how we pursue that. It isn't an issue, I don't believe, in terms of the capacity of the organisation to deliver on that, and it will be something that is expected of that organisation to do. So, we'll be resisting that particular element.

[158] In regard to amendment 25, tabled by Bill Powell, in regard of past and future trends regarding the state of natural resources, we believe, Bill, the existing provisions in the Bill already provide for an assessment for past and future trends. Section 8 of this Bill includes the necessary criteria for providing a full assessment of past and present and future data on the state of natural resources, and we believe that the amendment you've tabled is unnecessary and will not be seeking to support that today.

[159] Llyr's amendment 98 would require NRW to include its assessment, any actions and consequences of those actions, and further proposed actions to improve the sustainable management of natural resources. Again, I think

it's the interpretation of this. I'm concerned with the effects on the purpose of SoNaRR, as an evidence base. There are potential conflicts in developing evidence and policy at the same time, and I'm a bit concerned about that, actually. It's not for SoNaRR to develop policies about the state of the nation. So, I won't be supporting that principle, but I will look to see if we need to strengthen the drafting in other areas so that gives you confidence in terms of which parts relate to which in that aspect.

[160] Again, amendment 100, by which the Member is seeking for me not to issue directions or guidance to NRW: it's an interesting concept, because I'm forever being asked for more guidance from organisations, but I do understand the purpose of the amendment in terms of not trying to fetter the decisions of the independent organisation. I don't think it does, and I will give some further thought again about clarity within the Bill to ensure and give confidence to Members about the independence of that organisation. We already issue NRW with a remit letter in terms of actions, and whether we can incorporate some of the detail or guidance around that within the remit letter or something—. But I will try to give some more clarity to the Members at Stage 3.

[161] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Janet i ymateb. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Janet to respond.

[162] **Janet Haworth:** Thank you, Chair. We will of course be supporting all these amendments, including our two amendments. Russell George has emphasised once again the importance of landscape and NRW's role in helping us to protect that.

[163] William Powell stressed the relationship of past performance as an indicator of future performance, and I don't think that this concept should be disparaged or denied. There is a clear relationship between those two. And, of course, these amendments are again seeking to stress the importance of the independence of NRW in their deliberations and any advice they might give to planning and to us. So, that's the intent behind these amendments, and we will be supporting them all.

10:30

[164] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Mae Janet, felly, am symud i bleidlais ar welliant 120. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Janet, therefore, wishes to proceed to a vote on amendment

yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 120? 120. The question is that amendment  
 Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? 120 be agreed. Any objections?  
 [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, fe gawn ni [*Objection.*] We will therefore have a  
 bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant vote. All those in favour of  
 120. Dau. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'r amendment 120. Two. And against.  
 gwelliant yna'n methu, felly. So, that amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 120: O blaid 2, Yn erbyn 8, Ymatal 0.*  
*Amendment 120: For 2, Against 8, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:
George, Russell Haworth, Janet	Antoniw, Mick Cuthbert, Jeff Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Morgan, Julie Powell, William Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 120.*  
*Amendment 120 not agreed.*

[165] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell,  
 gwelliant 17. amendment 17.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 17 (Russell George).*  
*Amendment 17 (Russell George) moved.*

[166] **Russell George:** Move.

[167] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that  
 yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 17? amendment 17 be agreed. Any  
 Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? objection? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed  
 [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i to a vote, therefore. All those in  
 bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid favour of amendment 17, please  
 gwelliant 17 i ddangos, os gwelwch show. And against. Six. I abstain. So,  
 yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Chwech. Rwy'n that amendment falls.  
 ymatal. Felly, mae'r gwelliant hwnnw  
 wedi syrthio.

*Gwelliant 17: O blaid 3, Yn erbyn 6, Ymatal 1.  
Amendment 17: For 3, Against 6, Abstain 1.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

Jones, Alun Ffred

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 17.  
Amendment 17 not agreed.*

[168] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, **Alun Ffred Jones:** William,  
gwelliant 24. amendment 24.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 24 (William Powell).  
Amendment 24 (William Powell) moved.*

[169] **William Powell:** Cynnig.

**William Powell:** I move.

[170] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 24? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 24 i ddangos. Tri. Ac yn erbyn. Saith. Mae'r gwelliant wedi methu, felly.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 24 be agreed. Any objections? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote, therefore. All those in favour of amendment 24 to show. Three. And against. Seven. That amendment is not agreed, therefore.

*Gwelliant 24: O blaid 3, Yn erbyn 7, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 24: For 3, Against 7, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Morgan, Julie

Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 24.*  
*Amendment 24 not agreed.*

[171] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, **Alun Ffred Jones:** William,  
gwelliant 25. amendment 25.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 25 (William Powell).*  
*Amendment 25 (William Powell) moved.*

[172] **William Powell:** Cynnig. **William Powell:** Move.

[173] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. The  
fawr. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn question is that amendment 25 be  
gwelliant 25? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? agreed to. Any objections?  
[*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote  
ar welliant 25. Pawb sydd o blaid on amendment 25. All those in  
gwelliant 25. Ac yn erbyn. Pump. favour of amendment 25. And  
Cyfartal—pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. against. Five. That's tied. So, the  
Mae'r gwelliant yn syrthio. casting vote is in the negative. The  
amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 25: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*  
*Amendment 25: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:

George, Russell	Antoniw, Mick
Gruffydd, Llyr	Cuthbert, Jeff
Haworth, Janet	Morgan, Julie
Jones, Alun Ffred	Rathbone, Jenny
Powell, William	Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais  
fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*  
*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in  
accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 25.*  
*Amendment 25 not agreed.*

[174] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment  
gwelliant 98. 98.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 98 (Llyr Gruffydd).*  
*Amendment 98 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[175] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

[176] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that  
yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 98? amendment 98 be agreed to. Any  
Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? objections? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed  
[*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i to a vote. All those in favour of  
bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant amendment 98 to show. And against.  
98 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal— That's tied. The casting vote is in the  
pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Mae'r negative. The amendment falls.  
gwelliant yn methu.

*Gwelliant 98: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*  
*Amendment 98: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Haworth, Janet Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William	Antoniw, Mick Cuthbert, Jeff Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais  
fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*  
*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in  
accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 98.*  
*Amendment 98 not agreed.*

[177] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment  
gwelliant 99. 99.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 99 (Llyr Gruffydd, gyda chefnogaeth William Powell).*



*Amendment 99 (Llyr Gruffydd, supported by William Powell) moved.*

[178] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

[179] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 99? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 99, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Pleidlais gyfartal—pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Mae'r gwelliant yn methu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 99 be agreed to. Any objections? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 99 please show. And against. There's a tied vote, and the casting vote is in the negative. The amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 99: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 99: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 99.*

*Amendment 99 not agreed.*

[180] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gan fod 23 wedi methu, mae 26 wedi methu. Felly, mae 26 wedi ei gollu o achos 23. Symudwn ymlaen, felly, at welliant 82. William, a ydych yn dymuno cynnig 82?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** As amendment 23 was not agreed, 26 fell. Therefore, 26 falls because of 23. Therefore, we'll move on to amendment 82. William, do you wish to move amendment 82?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 82 (William Powell).*

*Amendment 82 (William Powell) moved.*

[181] **William Powell:** Cynnig.

**William Powell:** I move.

[182] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 82? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 82 i ddangos. Pump. Ac yn erbyn. Pump. Pleidlais gyfartal—pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Mae'r gwelliant yn methu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 82 be agreed to. Any objections? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 82 please show. Five. And against. Five. The vote is tied and the casting vote is in the negative. The amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 82: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 82: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 82.  
Amendment 82 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 45 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 45 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[183] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 45 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 45? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Felly, mae'r gwelliant yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 45 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 45 be agreed to. Any objections? There are no objections. So, the amendment is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 45 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*  
*Amendment 45 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 46 (Carl Sargeant).*  
*Amendment 46 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[184] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 46 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 46? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 46 i ddangos. Saith. Ac yn erbyn. Tri. Mae'r gwelliant yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 46 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 46 be agreed. Any objections? [*Objection.*] So, we'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 46 please show. Seven. And against. Three. So, the amendment is agreed.

*Gwelliant 46: O blaid 7, Yn erbyn 3, Ymatal 0.*  
*Amendment 46: For 7, Against 3, Abstain 0.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
Antoniw, Mick Cuthbert, Jeff George, Russell Haworth, Janet Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William	

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 46.*  
*Amendment 46 agreed.*

[185] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 100.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment 100.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 100 (Llyr Gruffydd).*  
*Amendment 100 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[186] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** Move.

[187] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 100?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 100 be agreed. Any

Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? objections? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed  
 [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i to a vote, therefore. All those in  
 bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid favour of amendment 100. Thank  
 gwelliant 100. Diolch yn fawr. Pump. you very much. Five. And against.  
 Ac yn erbyn. Pump. Felly, cyfartal— Five. So, the vote is tied and the  
 pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Mae'r casting vote goes against. The  
 gwelliant yn methu. amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 100: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
 Amendment 100: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:
George, Russell	Antoniw, Mick	
Gruffydd, Llyr	Cuthbert, Jeff	
Haworth, Janet	Morgan, Julie	
Jones, Alun Ffred	Rathbone, Jenny	
Powell, William	Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 100.  
 Amendment 100 not agreed.*

[188] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Ar y pwynt yna, rwy'n cymryd egwyl o 10 munud i chi gael paned, neu beth bynnag. **Alun Ffred Jones:** At that point, we will take a 10-minute break for you to have a cup of tea, or whatever you wish.

[189] A 10-minute break.

*Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 10:34 a 10:45.  
 The meeting adjourned between 10:34 and 10:45.*

**Grŵp 4: Polisi Adnoddau Naturiol Cenedlaethol (Gwelliannau 83, 101, 47, 27, 48, 121, 122, 18, 4 a 103)**

**Group 4: National Natural Resources Policy (Amendments 83, 101, 47, 27, 48, 121, 122, 18, 4 and 103)**

[190] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Fe wnawn ni ailagor y pwyllgor a symud ymlaen gyda'r gwelliannau, ac i grŵp 4. Mae grŵp 4 yn ymwneud â'r polisi adnoddau naturiol cenedlaethol. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 83 yn enw William Powell. Galwaf ar William i siarad am ei welliant.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** We will reconvene and proceed with the amendments, and to group 4. Group 4 relates to the national natural resources policy. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 83 in the name of William Powell. I call on William to speak to his amendment.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 83 (William Powell).*

*Amendment 83 (William Powell) moved.*

[191] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I have two amendments in this group. Amendment 83 is a simple strengthening amendment. The words 'contributing to' have the potential to weaken the duty on Welsh Ministers so that the importance of the national natural resources policy in terms of achieving the sustainable management of natural resources is undermined. So, this amendment simply removes those words from this section so as to provide that extra strength.

[192] Amendment 27 is in line with our committee recommendation 20. In the context of the sustainable management of natural resources, challenges are just as important as priorities and opportunities. This is a very simple amendment that makes sure that any challenges are a feature of the national natural resources plan. However, I'm also happy with the Minister's inclusion of the word 'risks' in amendment 47; so, I'm happy to support that, knowing that my amendment will then consequently fall.

[193] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Llyr Gruffydd.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Llyr Gruffydd.

[194] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I'll be supporting most amendments in this group. My amendment 101 inserts into section 9 that the Welsh Ministers must publish any advice or responses that they receive as part of any consultation that they carry out before they publish the NNRP. I think that would clearly strengthen transparency and accountability, and I think

that is particularly important in this section because of the key role that the NNRP will play.

[195] Amendment 103 requires the Welsh Ministers to review the NNRP within 12 months following a general election. The Government, in its evidence to the committee, told us that the first NNRP would be published in spring 2017 and that it would be likely to be reviewed towards the end of 2019. This timescale suggests that it would be possible for the second NNRP to be ready for publication early in the sixth Assembly; that is, within 12 months of the 2021 Assembly elections. So, providing a more specific timescale for the review of the NNRP would offer some assurance, I think, that it would be regularly updated.

[196] I won't be supporting Janet Haworth's amendment 121 because I prefer Janet Haworth's amendment 122.

[197] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Janet Haworth i siarad. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Janet Haworth to speak.

[198] **Janet Haworth:** Thank you, Chair. I'm going to speak this morning to amendments 121 and 122. Both these amendments relate to the recommendations made in the committee report at Stage 1 of this process.

[199] In amendment 121 we are proposing that the Minister brings forward amendments to the Bill to provide more detailed criteria for the minimum content of the national natural resources plan. These amendments seek to ensure that there is greater clarity on the plan's contents and to allay the fears that were expressed to the committee by farming unions and the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds on how this policy may influence Glastir and the rural development plan.

[200] Amendment 122 again refers to committee recommendation 18 and recommendation 15 by creating a link to the framework of milestones and indicators that are being established under the future generations Act. It provides transparency around what the minimum content of the NNRP should include so that key environmental issues are not excluded from this policy. It is worth noting that some environmental organisations have expressed concern that the minimum criteria in the Bill, as currently drafted, give discretion for a large range of issues to be excluded from the policy.

[201] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Russell George.

[202] **Russell George:** Thank you, Chair. I speak to amendment 18 in my name in this grouping and, as per my previous comments, I remain, of course, unconvinced that the Bill, as it stands, recognises the fundamental role that landscapes play in providing the overall contextual framework for the sustainable management of Wales's natural resources, which links with people and their surroundings, thereby providing a human context and social underpinning to the Bill.

[203] I completely agree with stakeholders who've expressed the view that a national natural resources policy must be based upon the principle of managing all elements of the environment. Therefore, if a holistic approach is to be achieved, landscapes and seascapes cannot be ignored and, on the contrary, they must be a central part of the Bill. This amendment would ensure that the national natural resources policy, which Welsh Ministers will prepare, gives full regard to landscapes and seascapes.

[204] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. A oes unrhyw un arall sydd i siarad, os gwelwch yn dda. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Any other speakers? No. The Minister to eisiau siarad? Na. Y Gweinidog i siarad, please.

[205] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you Chair. The Government amendments in this group seek to respond directly to the committee's recommendation in its Stage 1 report. I believe the amendments will enhance this provision and I'm grateful for the committee's input on this.

[206] Can I speak to some of the contributions from colleagues this morning? Amendment 48 ensures that the NNRP considers biodiversity as a whole and reflects that biodiversity is a wider issue than just a specific species or habitat that are covered by the list and thereby avoids overly restricting its scope. Therefore, I don't believe 122 or, indeed, 121 are appropriate or needed in this framework.

[207] The issues raised by Llyr on amendment 101—again it's the drafting and the requirement that the Members put in. I am restricted in what I can do and publish in terms of advice on many actions, because of legal advice, and we're not able to disclose some of that. However, if the Member were to consider not moving this today and bringing back an amended version, which would just cover the responses, as opposed to advice and responses, then I would consider supporting them at Stage 3. But today I can't support

that on the drafting proposals.

[208] In relation to—sorry, Chair—the amendment in the name of—where are we now? It's 18, again with Russell George. I'm sorry. We have rerun this discussion right the way through the committee. The purpose of our drafting is around biotic and abiotic principles, which does cover the whole natural landscape. The move by Russell George to pursue this with vigour—and I recognise the reasoning behind this—would, we believe, conflict with manmade structures—as I said earlier on, castles and, potentially, renewable energy windfarms. I do understand the Member's view on this, but it does compromise the Bill in terms of landscapes. I can understand the reason he's doing this for, but we will not be supporting any move, in any part of the Bill, around this pursuit by Russell in his landscape intervention.

[209] **Alun Ffred Jones:** You're not building any castles these days, are you? [*Laughter.*] Anyway, I don't want to go into that.

[210] **Carl Sargeant:** In the north we may, Chair. [*Laughter.*]

[211] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William i ymateb i'r ddadl. **Alun Ffred Jones:** William to reply to the debate.

[212] **William Powell:** Diolch yn fawr, Gadeirydd. Many of the amendments in this group are around transparency, and given the integral role that the NNRP has in the delivery of the Bill, I think that's to be welcomed. I plan to support Llyr Gruffydd's amendment 101 and agree that the provision of information and evidence early in the process is essential to effective participation.

[213] I also welcome the Minister's amendment 48, as I stated earlier. This serves to clarify that the NNRP should include biodiversity. I'll be voting for Janet Haworth's amendment 122 and feel that this provides a stronger and more preferable option than either amendment 121 or amendment 18.

[214] I am disappointed the Minister seems unable to support my amendment 83 at this time, but I hope that we can maintain dialogue so as to achieve some of the outcomes that we both share. Diolch yn fawr.

[215] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr, William. A ydych chi'n dymuno symud i bleidlais ar welliant 83, amendment 83, William? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you, William. Do you wish to proceed to a vote on amendment 83, William?



[216] **William Powell:** Cynnig.

**William Powell:** I move.

[217] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 83. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Felly, symudwn i bleidlais ar welliant 83. Pawb sydd o blaid i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn a'r gwelliant yn methu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 83 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll therefore move to a vote on amendment 83. All those in favour, please indicate. And those against. It's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative and therefore the amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 83: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 83: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 83.*

*Amendment 83 not agreed.*

[218] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 101.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 101?

[219] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ni wnaf symud gwelliant 101, yn dilyn sylwadau'r Gweinidog.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I won't be moving 101, following the Minister's comments.

[220] **Alun Ffred Jones:** lawn. Nid yw Llyr yn symud gwelliant 101, felly.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Right. So, Llyr isn't moving amendment 101, therefore.

Diolch yn fawr.

Thank you.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 101 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 101 (Llyr Gruffydd) not moved.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 47 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 47 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[221] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 47 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Os derbynnir gwelliant 47, bydd gwelliant 27 yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 47. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae 47 wedi ei dderbyn, felly mae gwelliant 27 yn methu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 47 in the name of the Minister. If amendment 47 is agreed, amendment 27 falls. The question is that amendment 47 be agreed. Does any Member object? There are no objections. Therefore, 47 is agreed and amendment 27 falls.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 47 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 47 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Methodd gwelliant 27.  
Amendment 27 fell.*

[222] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, symudwn i welliant 28. William, a ydych chi eisiau cynnig gwelliant 28?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** We'll therefore move to amendment 28. William, do you wish to move amendment 28?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 28 (William Powell).  
Amendment 28 (William Powell) moved.*

[223] **William Powell:** Cynnig.

**William Powell:** I move.

[224] **Alun Ffred Jones:** lawn. A ddylid derbyn gwelliant 28? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais ar 28. Felly, pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 28 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn, ac felly mae'r gwelliant yn methu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Right. The question is that amendment 28 be agreed. Does any Member object? [Objection.] We'll move to a vote on 28. So, all those in favour of 28, please indicate. All those against. It's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative, and the amendment

falls.

*Gwelliant 28: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 28: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 28.*

*Amendment 28 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 48 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 48 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[225] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 48 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 48. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 48 yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 48 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 48 be agreed. Does any Member object? There are no objections, and therefore amendment 48 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 48 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 48 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[226] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 102.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 102?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 102 (Llyr Gruffydd).*

*Amendment 102 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[227] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[228] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynnig. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 102. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 102, felly, i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Pump. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn, ac mae gwelliant 102 yn methu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 102 is agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 102 to indicate, please. Five. And those against. There's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative, and amendment 102 falls.

*Gwelliant 102: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 102: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:
George, Russell	Antoniw, Mick	
Gruffydd, Llyr	Cuthbert, Jeff	
Haworth, Janet	Morgan, Julie	
Jones, Alun Ffred	Rathbone, Jenny	
Powell, William	Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 102.  
Amendment 102 not agreed.*

[229] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, gwelliant 121.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, do you wish to move amendment 121?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 121 (Janet Haworth).  
Amendment 121 (Janet Haworth) moved.*

[230] **Janet Haworth:** I move, Chair.

[231] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 121. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 121 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll

[*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i move to a vote. All those in favour of bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 121 to indicate. Two. And those 121 i ddangos. Dau. Yn erbyn. Saith. against. Seven. One abstention. Un yn ymatal. Felly, mae'r gwelliant Therefore, the amendment falls. yn methu.

*Gwelliant 121: O blaid 2, Yn erbyn 7, Ymatal 1.  
Amendment 121: For 2, Against 7, Abstain 1.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Morgan, Julie  
Powell, William  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

Jones, Alun Ffred

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 121.  
Amendment 121 not agreed.*

[232] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 122, Janet. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Amendment 122, Janet.

[233] Do you want to move it?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 122 (Janet Haworth).  
Amendment 122 (Janet Haworth) moved.*

[234] **Janet Haworth:** I move, Chair.

[235] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 122. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 122, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn, ac mae'r gwelliant yn methu. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. The question is that amendment 122 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Inaudible.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 122, please indicate. And those against. There's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative, and the amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 122: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 122: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:
George, Russell	Antoniw, Mick	
Gruffydd, Llyr	Cuthbert, Jeff	
Haworth, Janet	Morgan, Julie	
Jones, Alun Ffred	Rathbone, Jenny	
Powell, William	Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).  
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 122.  
Amendment 122 not agreed.*

[236] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, do you wish to move amendment 18?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 18 (Russell George).  
Amendment 18 (Russell George) moved.*

[237] **Russell George:** Move.

[238] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 18. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 18 i ddangos. Dau. Yn erbyn. Saith. Un yn ymatal. Mae'r gwelliant yn methu, felly.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 18 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 18, please indicate. Two. And those against. Seven. One abstention. Therefore, the amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 18: O blaid 2, Yn erbyn 7, Ymatal 1.  
Amendment 18: For 2, Against 7, Abstain 1.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Morgan, Julie  
Powell, William  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

Jones, Alun Ffred

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 18.*

*Amendment 18 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 4 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 4 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[239] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 4 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 4. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 4 yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 4 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 4 be agreed. Does any Member object? There are no objections. Amendment 4 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 4 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 4 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[240] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 103?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 103?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 103 (Llyr Gruffydd).*

*Amendment 103 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[241] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[242] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynnig. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 103. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 103 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn mynd yn erbyn. Gwelliant yn methu. Diolch yn fawr.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 103 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 103, please indicate. All those against. There's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative. The amendment falls. Thank you.

*Gwelliant 103: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 103: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:
George, Russell	Antoniw, Mick	
Gruffydd, Llyr	Cuthbert, Jeff	
Haworth, Janet	Morgan, Julie	
Jones, Alun Ffred	Rathbone, Jenny	
Powell, William	Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 103.  
Amendment 103 not agreed.*

[243] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Dyna **Alun Ffred Jones:** That concludes ddiwedd y grŵp yna. consideration of that group.

**Grŵp 5: Datganiadau Ardal (Gwelliannau 29, 84, 123, 50, 19, 124, 5, 49, 105, 85, 86, 87, 88, 13 a 134)**

**Group 5: Area Statements (Amendments 29, 84, 123, 50, 19, 124, 5, 49, 105, 85, 86, 87, 88, 13 and 134)**

[244] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rydym yn **Alun Ffred Jones:** We move to group symud i grŵp 5 sy'n ymwneud â 5, which relates to area statements. datganiadau ardal. Y prif welliant yn y The lead amendment in the group is grŵp yw gwelliant 29 yn enw William amendment 29 in the name of Powell, ac rwy'n galw ar William William Powell, and I call on William Powell i siarad am ei welliant a'r Powell to speak to his amendment and other amendments in the group. gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp. William. William.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 29 (William Powell, gyda chefnogaeth Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 29 (William Powell, supported by Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[245] **William Powell:** Diolch, **William Powell:** Thank you, Chair. Gadeirydd.



[246] During the scrutiny process of this Bill, we had confirmation from the Minister that area statements would cover the whole of Wales. Whilst this intention isn't doubted, the committee felt that the Bill should be futureproofed in this respect and should specify that they will, in fact, cover the whole of Wales, and that is precisely what amendment 29 seeks to do.

11:00

[247] **William Powell:** Turning now to amendment 84, the Aarhus convention establishes a number of rights of the public, either individuals or associations or groups, with regard to the environment, including, and I quote,

[248] 'Access to Environmental Information and Public Participation in Environmental Decision-making'.

[249] This amendment seeks to make sure that this section on area statements is in full compliance with the Aarhus convention, and sufficiently allows for the provision of information and evidence and at an early enough stage in the process. This is absolutely essential to ensure effective participation.

[250] Amendments 85 and 86 seek to require public bodies to publish any information that is provided to NRW for the purposes of preparing and for producing both the SoNaRR and, indeed, the area statements. Similarly, amendments 87 and amendment 88 require NRW to publish information that it provides to public bodies for the purpose of implementing an area statement. Diolch yn fawr.

[251] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Janet Howarth.

[252] **Janet Howarth:** Thank you, Chair. I'm going to speak to amendments 123, 124 and 134. In speaking to these amendments, amendment 123 calls for Natural Resources Wales to consult water or sewage undertakers before publishing an area statement. The original Bill did not mention water or sewage undertakers in the list of public bodies found under section 11, and this amendment seeks to rectify this. Amendment 124 aims to ensure that NRW considers the marine environment when considering the priorities, risks and opportunities when developing area statements. This consideration feeds into the development of priorities, risks and opportunities as required by the Act. It has been clarified that area statements will apply to terrestrial

and coastal areas, but it is important that the downstream impacts of management in these areas on the marine environment are considered as part of this process. This amendment has been drawn up following discussion with Wales Environmental Link.

[253] Amendment 134 would mean that the NNRP and area statements are added to, and I quote,

[254] ‘The matters to which a marine plan authority is to have regard in preparing a marine plan’

[255] under the Marine and Coastal Access Act 2009. The NNRP covers the whole of Wales out to the territorial limit of 12 nautical miles. Area statements cover the terrestrial and coastal areas of Wales. The Wales national marine plan covers both inshore and offshore water, extending up to the level of mean high water spring tides, whilst land use planning boundaries generally extend to mean low water spring tides, likely for the area statements. The WNMP therefore overlaps physically with a number of plans in the land use planning system. To help facilitate integration between land and sea, the Marine and Coastal Access Act 2009 ensures that in preparing a marine plan, the marine planning authority must take all reasonable steps to ensure compatibility with any relevant plans, specifically referencing planning Act plans.

[256] These amendments to the MCAA would ensure that Welsh Government is to have regard to the NNRP and any relevant area statement in preparing the marine plan, in line with other planning regimes. This is an opportunity to ensure that the planning systems across land and sea interface. Traditionally fragmented, they could be more coherent and integrated and ensure greater transparency throughout the environmental management in Wales.

[257] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Russell George.

[258] **Russell George:** Thank you, Chair. I speak to amendment 19 in my name in this grouping. I am unconvinced that the Bill, as it stands, explicitly recognises the role which landscapes play, and this amendment seeks to ensure that landscapes are considered in the area-based implementation of natural resources policy. The way in which my amendments have been grouped today have meant that I’ve returned to landscapes a number of times; I suspect this will be the last time I do mention it. I’m, of course, fully

aware of the Minister's views on this. And the only thing I should add, Chair, is that I haven't got anything against a few castles being built and, in fact, there may be a good need for them in some parts of my constituency.

[259] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Llyr Gruffydd.

[260] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch. My only amendment in this group is 105, and it's based on the committee recommendation—recommendation 24—from our Stage 1 report, to place a duty on Welsh public bodies to take all reasonable steps to implement area statements. Now, if area statements are to play the role that we believe is envisaged for them, then organisations other than NRW alone, of course, will need to implement them. The most robust way of ensuring this is to place public bodies, in addition to the Welsh Ministers, under a duty to take all reasonable steps to implement them. This Bill has to be strong enough to bind future administrations to the provisions of the bill if its longer term impact is to be secured. I trust Members are still of the same opinion as when we discussed that during Stage 1.

[261] Now, I also feel that many amendments in this group go to great lengths to articulate exactly what must be done in producing area statements, and, sometimes, I think we can go too far, actually, particularly on the face of the Bill. And there is a risk, I think, that there's a cumulative impact as well, in terms of creating quite an onerous burden on some bodies. Yes, it's important that we ensure transparency and openness, but, sometimes, I think we have to trust that those provisions are already covered in other ways in the Bill, or that these principles are already expected from organisations—publicly funded organisations—such as NRW. That's not to say I'll be voting against all of those particular amendments, but I fear that there is a danger sometimes that we can maybe go a bit too far.

[262] Amendment 84, for example, creates an extensive list of stipulations of what must be done before publishing an area statement, a lot of which, maybe, you could expect as good practice, and I don't think we need to be so explicit, or at least, not on the face of the Bill. You know, maybe we could do that kind of thing in regulation. And, likewise, requiring public bodies to publish all information NRW asks of them, I think, is excessive as well.

[263] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Aelod arall? Julie Morgan. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Any other Member? Julie Morgan.

[264] **Julie Morgan:** Thank you very much. I just wanted to say that I feel that

the points that Janet Haworth is making in 124 and 134 are important points. And I'd like the reassurance from the Minister that there is no gap between what we're planning for the land and what we're planning for the sea. And I think it's absolutely vital that there is a coherent plan for the land and the sea together. So, I would be grateful if the Minister would be able to reassure us of that.

[265] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Weinidog. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Minister.

[266] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I'm supporting the Government amendments in this group. Amendment 50 sets out additional requirements that NRW must consider before publishing an area statement. This amendment goes further, we believe, than the committee recommendation 23, as it provides more detail on how NRW will take action to implement these statements.

[267] Amendment 5 amends the language in section 10, in relation to the area statements, directly addressing the views of the committee in recommendation 10 of its report. And Government amendment 13 makes a link directly between the Environment (Wales) Bill and the Planning (Wales) Act 2015 by amending the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

[268] I ask committee to support the Government amendments.

[269] Can I turn to the issues raised by Members during their contribution today? Again, I think that many of the amendments tabled by Members are quite detailed, and I think it may be just a lack of clarity that we've given, in terms of Members' understanding, or organisations' understanding. It's very clear to us about what is covered in the Bill, and Julie Morgan's point, and that of Janet—. The drafting of your amendment is something that I can't support as of today. However, I think that the principle of what you're seeking to do is to clarify the whole coverage of coastal, marine and land planning. It's something that I have given an assurance on to the committee, and I will look at an amendment—a suitable amendment—for Stage 3, which I hope will give you some clarity at that point. But it is our intention, as you both allude to, to have complete coverage in that process.

[270] I listened carefully to Llyr's contribution. We agree completely that, sometimes, you can overburden some organisations in terms of the requirements and detail on the face of the Bill. While, again, there were some

important principles set out by William Powell in his amendments, there are some things that I wouldn't wish to see on the face of the Bill, and it's something that we perhaps need to have a further discussion on in terms of what he is seeking to achieve and what we can achieve outside the scope of directly placing it on the face and giving him confidence in that process.

[271] I'm grateful that Russell George raises the issue of landscapes again, hopefully for the last time, as he said. He will not be gaining our support for amendment 19 for the reasons I discussed earlier in the contribution. Again, amendment 29, tabled by William Powell, follows the committee recommendation of 22 and would amend section 10 to ensure the coverage of the area statements is applied to the whole of Wales, including the coastal areas. Again, I support it in principle. There is some duplication in some of the drafting of all the amendments. We are going to try to look at what the overarching aim is for this committee and see if we can bring something back at Stage 3, but we won't be seeking to support opposition amendments in this guise today.

[272] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you, fawr, Weinidog. William Powell i Minister. William Powell to reply. ymateb.

[273] **William Powell:** In the light of what the Minister had to say, I will not be moving amendment 29, as it's certainly not my intention to limit the area covered by area statements in the way that I understand could potentially be a problem, and I'm grateful for the indication that we can come back to this in a more precise fashion at Stage 3.

[274] I particularly welcome the amendment by Janet Howarth relating to the need for greater equity between terrestrial and marine environment, and that echoes quite a lot of work that this committee did in the first half of this Assembly, and it's good to see it being brought forward today. I'll be supporting all amendments in the group, with the exception of amendment 123. I support the sentiment underlying that amendment, but I think it could be covered adequately by our amendment 84, which seeks to make a broader provision around consultation.

[275] Amendment 50, which provides clarity on the minimum contents required to be set out in an area statement is welcomed, as is amendment 105, which would place a duty on Welsh public bodies to take all reasonable steps to implement area statements. That was a committee recommendation

that has been supported in principle by the Minister. Once again, many of the amendments in this group relate to openness, transparency and a full and proper public consultation, and I'm appreciative of the discussion that we've had around these matters this morning.

*Tynnwyd gwelliant 29 yn ôl gyda chaniatâd y pwyllgor.*  
*Amendment 29 withdrawn by leave of the committee.*

[276] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr iawn, William. Mae gwelliant 29 wedi'i dynnu yn ôl. Felly, William, a ydych chi eisiau cynnig gwelliant 84?  
**Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you, William. Amendment 29 has been withdrawn. Therefore, William, do you wish to move amendment 84?

[277] **William Powell:** Heb ei gynnig.  
**William Powell:** Not moved.

[278] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Wyth deg pedwar?  
**Alun Ffred Jones:** Eighty four?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 84 (William Powell).*  
*Amendment 84 (William Powell) moved.*

[279] **William Powell:** O, 84—cynnig.  
**William Powell:** Oh, 84—I move.

[280] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 84? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 84 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Tri. Yn erbyn. Pump. Ymatal. Dau. Felly, dydy'r gwelliant ddim wedi pasio.  
**Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. The question is that amendment 84 be agreed. Does any Member object? [Objection.] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 84 please indicate. Three. Those against. Five. And two abstentions. Therefore, the amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 84: O blaid 3, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 2.*  
*Amendment 84: For 3, Against 5, Abstain 2.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie

Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred

Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 84.*  
*Amendment 84 not agreed.*

[281] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, amendment  
gwelliant 123. 123.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 123 (Janet Haworth).*  
*Amendment 123 (Janet Haworth) moved.*

[282] **Janet Haworth:** I move, Chair.

[283] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. The  
fawr. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn question is that amendment 123 be  
gwelliant 123? Unrhyw agreed. Does any Member object?  
wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All  
Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o those in favour of amendment 123.  
blaid gwelliant 123. Ac yn erbyn. And those against. Six against and  
Chwech yn erbyn. Pedwar o blaid. four in favour. Therefore, the  
Felly, mae'r gwelliant yn methu. amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 123: O blaid 4, Yn erbyn 6, Ymatal 0.*  
*Amendment 123: For 4, Against 6, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Powell, William  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 123.*  
*Amendment 123 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 50 (Carl Sargeant).*  
*Amendment 50 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[284] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment

gwelliant 50 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y 50 in the name of the Minister. The  
cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn question is that amendment 50 be  
gwelliant 50? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? agreed. Does any Member object? No.  
Nac oes. Mae'r gwelliant yn pasio. Therefore, the amendment is carried.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 50 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 50 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[285] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell,  
gwelliant 19. amendment 19.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 19 (Russell George).*

*Amendment 19 (Russell George) moved.*

[286] **Russell George:** I move.

[287] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that  
yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 19? amendment 19 be agreed.  
[*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Gwrthwynebiad. [Objection.] Objection. Therefore,  
Felly, symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb o we'll move to a vote. All those in  
blaid gwelliant 19. Dau. Ac yn erbyn. favour of amendment 19. Two. Those  
Wyth. Felly, mae'r gwelliant yn against. Eight. Therefore, the  
methu. amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 19: O blaid 2, Yn erbyn 8, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 19: For 2, Against 8, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Morgan, Julie  
Powell, William  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 19.*

*Amendment 19 not agreed.*

[288] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to



gwelliant 104.

move amendment 104?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 104 (Llyr Gruffydd).*

*Amendment 104 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[289] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

11:15

[290] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 104? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 104 i ddangos hynny. Yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Gwelliant 104 yn methu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 104 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 104 to indicate. Those against. It's a tied vote. I'll use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 104 falls.

*Gwelliant 104: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 104: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 104.*

*Amendment 104 not agreed.*

[291] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, gwelliant 124.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, amendment 124.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 124 (Janet Haworth).*

*Amendment 124 (Janet Haworth) moved.*

[292] **Janet Haworth:** I so move, Chair.

[293] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 124? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 124 i ddangos hynny. O blaid. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Gwelliant 124 yn methu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 124 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 124, please indicate. And those against. Tied vote. I'll use the casting vote in the negative, and amendment 124 falls.

*Gwelliant 124: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 124: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 124.  
Amendment 124 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 5 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 5 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[294] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 5 yn enw'r Gweinidog. A ddylid derbyn gwelliant 5? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Gwelliant 5 yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 5 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 5 be agreed. Any objections? No objections. Amendment 5 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 5 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 5 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 49 (Carl Sargeant).*  
*Amendment 49 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[295] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 49 yn enw'r Gweinidog. A ddylid derbyn gwelliant 49? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae'r gwelliant yn pasio.

[296] **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 49 in the name of the Minister. Any objections to amendment 49? No objections. Therefore, the amendment is agreed.

[297] *Derbyniwyd gwelliant 49 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*  
*Amendment 49 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[298] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 105?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 105?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 105 (Llyr Gruffydd).*  
*Amendment 105 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[299] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[300] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 105? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 105. Pump yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Gwelliant 105 yn syrthio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 105 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 105. And five against. A tied vote. Casting vote in the negative. Amendment 105 falls.

*Gwelliant 105: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*  
*Amendment 105: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 105.*

*Amendment 105 not agreed.*

[301] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you  
cynnig gwelliant 85. wish to move amendment 85?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 85 (William Powell).*

*Amendment 85 (William Powell) moved.*

[302] **William Powell:** Cynnig.

**William Powell:** Move.

[303] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that  
yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 85? amendment 85 be agreed. Does any  
Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll  
[*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. move to a vote. All those in favour of  
Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 85 i amendment 85, please indicate.  
ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Tri. Ac Three. Those against, five.  
yn erbyn, pump. Ymatal, dau. Abstentions, two. Therefore,  
Gwelliant 85 yn syrthio, felly. amendment 85 falls.

*Gwelliant 85: O blaid 3, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 2.*

*Amendment 85: For 3, Against 5, Abstain 2.*

O blaid:

Yn erbyn:

Ymatal:

For:

Against:

Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 85.*

*Amendment 85 not agreed.*

[304] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you  
gwelliant 86. wish to move amendment 86?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 86 (William Powell).*  
*Amendment 86 (William Powell) moved.*

[305] **William Powell:** Cynnig.

**William Powell:** I move.

[306] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 86? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 86 i ddangos hynny. Pawb sydd o blaid, tri. Yn erbyn, pump. Ymatal, dau. Gwelliant yn methu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 86 be agreed. Does any Member object? [Objection.] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 86, please indicate. Three. All those against, five. Abstentions, two. The amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 86: O blaid 3, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 2.*  
*Amendment 86: For 3, Against 5, Abstain 2.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 86.*  
*Amendment 86 not agreed.*

[307] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, gwelliant 87.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you wish to move amendment 87?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 87 (William Powell).*  
*Amendment 87 (William Powell) moved.*

[308] **William Powell:** Cynnig.

**William Powell:** Move.

[309] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 87? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 87 be agreed. Does any Member object? [Objection.] We'll

[*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. move to a vote. All those in favour of  
 Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 87 i amendment 87, please indicate.  
 ddangos hynny. Tri. Yn erbyn, pump. Three. Those against, five.  
 Ymatal, dau. Gwelliant 87 yn methu, Abstentions, two. Therefore the  
 felly. amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 87: O blaid 3, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 2.  
 Amendment 87: For 3, Against 5, Abstain 2.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:
George, Russell	Antoniw, Mick	Gruffydd, Llyr
Haworth, Janet	Cuthbert, Jeff	Jones, Alun Ffred
Powell, William	Morgan, Julie	
	Rathbone, Jenny	
	Watson, Joyce	

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 87.  
 Amendment 87 not agreed.*

[310] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you  
 gwelliant 88. wish to move amendment 88?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 88 (William Powell).  
 Amendment 88 (William Powell) moved.*

[311] **William Powell:** Cynnig. **William Powell:** I move.

[312] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that  
 yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 88? amendment 88 be agreed. Any  
 Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? objections? [*Objection.*] We'll move to  
 [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. a vote. All those in favour of  
 Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 88 i amendment 88, please indicate.  
 ddangos hynny. Tri. Yn erbyn, pump. Three. Those against, five.  
 Ymatal, dau. Gwelliant 88 yn syrthio. Abstentions, two. Therefore,  
 amendment 88 falls.

*Gwelliant 88: O blaid 3, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 2.  
 Amendment 88: For 3, Against 5, Abstain 2.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 88.  
Amendment 88 not agreed.*

**Grŵp 6: Cynlluniau Arbrofol (Gwelliannau 51, 52, 125, 53, 54, a 55)  
Group 6: Experimental Schemes (Amendments 51, 52, 125, 53, 54, and 55)**

[313] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rŷm ni'n symud ymlaen felly i grŵp 6 sy'n ymwneud â chynlluniau arbrofol. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 51 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Rwy'n galw ar y Gweinidog i siarad am ei welliant a'r gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp. Weinidog.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** That brings us to group 6, which relates to experimental schemes. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 51 in the name of the Minister. I call on the Minister to speak to his amendment and other amendments in the group. Minister.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 51 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 51 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[314] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. Government amendment 51 is broadly technical. Amendment 52 is a consequential of that. Amendment 53 inserts a new requirement that requires Welsh Ministers, before making regulations under section 22, to satisfy that the overall effect does not increase the regulatory burden on any person. Amendment 54 responds to the second part of the committee's recommendation 26. Amendment 55 alters the definition of 'experimental schemes' in section 23 to include the development or testing of proposals for a regulatory change. I call on Members to support the Government amendments in this group.

[315] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Janet Haworth.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Janet Haworth.

[316] **Janet Haworth:** Thank you, Chair. I'm speaking to amendment 125, which reflects recommendation 26 in the Stage 1 committee report. Concern has been expressed over the types of experimental scheme that may be brought forward. Landowners are concerned over the suggestion that they

could be used to introduce general binding rules without proper consultation, and environment organisations are concerned that they could be used to relax conservation duties. Ensuring transparency around this process would offer significant reassurance to stakeholders and the Assembly. This amendment seeks to address this concern.

[317] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Aelodau eraill? William Powell. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Do any other Members wish to speak? William Powell.

[318] **William Powell:** Diolch yn fawr, Gadeirydd. I don't have any amendments tabled within this group, but I would like to make a short contribution. I've got some concerns around amendments 53 and 54, so I don't feel able to lend my support to them today. Amendment 53: whilst, obviously, minimising regulatory burden is a desirable thing in principle, amendment 53 does appear to compromise, potentially, proper risk-based regulation by prohibiting an increase in regulatory burden. I remain unclear as to what impact that could have in particular situations, and the detrimental effect that could have on our natural environment. Likewise, in amendment 54, instead of only being required to evaluate the scheme at such time as it considers appropriate, NRW should, in my view, be required to evaluate the scheme as part of the package of information that it makes available to Welsh Ministers for an application for an experimental scheme. It is important, in my view, that this legislation is clear about what the evaluation should include, and this evaluation absolutely should include a risk assessment. I understand, following conversations with the Minister and his team, that a risk assessment would be part of the package provided to Welsh Ministers in an application for such an experimental scheme; in which case, I think that this should be made more explicit in the Bill. Perhaps we can revisit this at Stage 3. Diolch yn fawr.

[319] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw un arall? Y Gweinidog, felly, i ymateb. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Anyone else? The Minister, then, to reply.

[320] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you. It's not very often I hear Members asking for more regulatory burden to be applied to organisations. Can I give Bill some reassurance? Essentially, amendment 53 provides a transparent assurance process that the regulatory burden is not increased and unnecessary bureaucracy is avoided, but in the balance between amendment 53 and amendment 54, and the principles of how experimental schemes will be applied, there is a very strong transparent process in the principle of the



amendment, taking into account the representations we received on general binding rules, balanced with the responses to the White Paper. The amendment ensures that the process, as I said, of bringing forward experimental schemes goes through a very robust procedure, even to the point of an affirmative vote in the Assembly. So, I believe that there are checks and balances at the appropriate levels without increasing the regulatory burden, and I would hope that the Member would see fit to support 53 and 52 on that basis.

[321] I will give it some further consideration in terms of the issue of risk assessment. While I give the Member assurance around that, about how, if we need to draft that into some sort of guidance, or ensuring NRW fully understand that.

[322] With regard to amendment 125, tabled by Janet Haworth, again I don't understand the need to provide a transparent process further with regard to that. As I said, the current process is given through an affirmative procedure. Detail of the experimental schemes would need to be presented to the Assembly as a whole, not just the Minister. It's an Assembly decision with regard to that, and it would also have to have supporting documentation alongside of that, such as an explanatory memorandum. So, I do believe that this is an extremely robust process that protects all stakeholders, including NRW and the customer and environmental principles. I would ask Members to consider supporting the Government amendments. Notwithstanding the intent of the Member on 125, I don't think it's necessary at this point.

[323] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Ocê. Diolch yn fawr iawn. Felly, rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 51 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 51? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 51 wedi ei gario, felly.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Okay. Thank you very much. Therefore, I move amendment 51 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 51 be agreed. Does any Member object? There are no objections and, therefore, amendment 51 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 51 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 51 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 52 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 52 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[324] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 52 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 52? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 52 wedi ei gario, felly.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 52 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 52 be agreed. Does any Member object? There are no objections, therefore, amendment 52 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 52 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*  
*Amendment 52 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[325] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 125?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, do you wish to move amendment 125?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 125 (Janet Haworth).*  
*Amendment 125 (Janet Haworth) moved.*

[326] **Janet Haworth:** I move.

[327] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn 125? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Rydym yn symud i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 125. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn, felly mae gwelliant 125 yn methu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 125 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote, therefore. All those in favour of amendment 125. And against. There's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative and amendment 125 falls.

*Gwelliant 125: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*  
*Amendment 125: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Haworth, Janet Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William	Antoniw, Mick Cuthbert, Jeff Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 125.  
Amendment 125 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 53 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 53 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[328] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 53 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 53? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Gwrthwynebiad. Rydym ni'n symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 53 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Pump. Yn erbyn. Felly, tri yn erbyn. Ymatal—sori? O, saith o blaid, mae'n ddrwg gennyf. Felly mae'r gwelliant wedi pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 53 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 53 be agreed. Does any Member object? [Objection.] Objection. We will move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 53 in the name of the Minister. Five. Against. So, three against. Any abstentions—sorry? Seven in favour; I do apologise. Therefore, the amendment is carried.

*Gwelliant 53: O blaid 7, Yn erbyn 3, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 53: For 7, Against 3, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:
Antoniw, Mick	Gruffydd, Llyr	
Cuthbert, Jeff	Jones, Alun Ffred	
George, Russell	Powell, William	
Haworth, Janet		
Morgan, Julie		
Rathbone, Jenny		
Watson, Joyce		

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 53.  
Amendment 53 agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 54 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 54 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[329] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 54 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 54 in the name of the Minister. The

cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 54? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Gwrthwynebiad. Felly, symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 54, os gwelwch yn dda. Saith o blaid. Yn erbyn, tri. Mae'r gwelliant yn pasio.

question is that amendment 54 be agreed. Does any Member object? [Objection.] Objection. We'll therefore move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 54, please indicate. Seven. Against, three. Therefore, the amendment is carried.

*Gwelliant 54: O blaid 7, Yn erbyn 3, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 54: For 7, Against 3, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 54.  
Amendment 54 agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 55 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 55 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[330] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 55 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 55? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 55 yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 55 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 55 be agreed. Does any Member object? No objections. Therefore, amendment 55 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 55 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 55 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 56 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 56 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[331] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 56 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 56 in the name of the Minister. The

cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn question is that amendment 56 be gwelliant 56? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? agreed. Does any Member object? No Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae 56 yn objections. Amendment 56 is agreed. pasio.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 56 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 56 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 57 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 57 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[332] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment gwelliant 57 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y 57 in the name of the Minister. The cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn question is that amendment 57 be gwelliant 57? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? agreed. Does any Member object? No Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant objections. Amendment 57 is agreed. 57 yn cario.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 57 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 57 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[333] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, do you ydych chi ishio cynnig gwelliant 20? wish to move amendment 20?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 20 (Russell George).*

*Amendment 20 (Russell George) moved.*

[334] **Russell George:** Move.

[335] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 20? A amendment 20 be agreed. Does any oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. move to a vote. All those in favour of Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 20 i amendment 20, please indicate. Two. ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Dau. Those against, eight. Therefore, the Yn erbyn, wyth. Felly, mae'r gwelliant amendment falls. yn methu.

*Gwelliant 20: O blaid 2, Yn erbyn 8, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 20: For 2, Against 8, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Morgan, Julie  
Powell, William  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 20.*  
*Amendment 20 agreed.*

[336] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Dyna **Alun Ffred Jones:** That concludes that  
ddiwedd y grŵp yna. group.

**Grŵp 7: Newid Hinsawdd: Targedau a Chyllidebau (Gwelliannau 30, 58, 106, 59, 60A, 60B, 60, 107, 108, 109, 61, 62, 63, 64, 31, 127, 110, 111, 89, 65, 66, 6, 7, 68, 71, 72, 73, 36 a 74)**

**Group 7: Climate Change: Targets and Budgets (Amendments 30, 58, 106, 59, 60A, 60B, 60, 107, 108, 109, 61, 62, 63, 64, 31, 127, 110, 111, 89, 65, 66, 6, 7, 68, 71, 72, 73, 36 and 74)**

[337] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gan ein bod **Alun Ffred Jones:** As we are ahead of  
ni o flaen amser, rwyf am symud time, I wish to move on to deal with  
ymlaen i ddelio â grŵp 7, sy'n group 7, which relates to—no, I  
ymwneud â—nac ydw, neu a ydw? le, don't, or do I? Yes, that's the one,  
hwnnw ydy o, yndê? Grŵp 7. Rwyf am isn't it? Group 7. We will move on to  
symud ymlaen at grŵp 7, newid group 7, climate change: targets and  
hinsawdd: targedau a chyllidebau. Y budgets. The lead amendment in this  
prif welliant yn y grŵp ydy gwelliant group is amendment 30 in the name  
30 yn enw William Powell. Rwy'n galw of William Powell. I call on William  
ar William Powell i siarad am ei Powell to speak to his amendment.  
welliant.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 30 (William Powell).*  
*Amendment 30 (William Powell) moved.*

[338] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Since the publication of this  
environment Bill, I have consistently called for stronger and more ambitious  
climate change targets, and amendment 30 would set the target at a 100 per

cent reduction in net emissions by 2050. The Climate Change Act 2008 sets out clearly a target of reducing our carbon emissions by 80 per cent by 2050 in order for the UK to play its part in limiting the rise in global temperature to 2 degrees Celsius. Since then, climate change science has moved on, and scientists have warned that progress to limit global warming to the vital 2 degrees C limit is too slow, that climate change risks are greater than was originally understood and that impacts are already widespread. This has led to many environmental groups maintaining that the 80 per cent target is simply now out of date.

[339] For the UK to merely match global efforts does not appear to be consistent with the UNFCCC requirement for 'differentiated responsibilities', and I outlined this yesterday in response to the ministerial statement. We should also not ignore our historical responsibility: the UK, like the United States and other developed countries, is more responsible, in the long term, for historical emissions than developing nations around the world. Therefore, we have a duty, in my view, to take on a greater share of the responsibility for making good, where we can, that possible damage; and given our industrial past, this applies more to Wales than, indeed, to anywhere else.

[340] On amendment 31, limiting global warming to no more than 2 degrees C has become the definitive target for global climate policy, and it was agreed, collectively, as committee, that this principle should be enshrined in the Bill. We know that the risk of allowing temperatures to rise higher than 2 degrees C is one, simply, that we cannot afford to take, and enshrining it in legislation is, therefore, in my view, of the utmost importance.

[341] Amendment 89 on 'strong and early action'. The 'Stern Review on the Economics of Climate Change' published back in 2006, stated that:

[342] 'the benefits of strong and early action far outweigh the economic costs of not acting'.

[343] I would maintain that early action should be taken when it comes to the issue of tackling emissions. Climate change will affect the basic elements of life for people around the planet—food production, access to water, health et cetera; and hundreds of millions of people could suffer hunger, water shortage and coastal flooding as a result of the globe's temperature rising.

11:30

[344] Using the results from formal economic models, the Stern review estimated that if we don't act, the overall cost and risk of climate change will be equivalent to losing at least 5 per cent of global gross domestic product per year, and if a wider range of risks and impacts is taken into account, the estimates of damage could rise to 20 per cent of GDP or more. Prompt and strong action is clearly warranted.

[345] Finally, my last amendment is amendment 36 on renewable energy. It had been my hope to bring forward an amendment to set renewable energy targets in the Bill, but as the Assembly does not currently have the legislative competence over the generation, transmission, distribution or supply of electricity, it was going to be difficult to bring forward an amendment that had any meaningful teeth.

[346] I did however feel that it was important that this Bill acknowledged the importance of renewable energy, particularly given the onslaught that's been brought forward in another place. Decarbonising the energy sector is the single biggest issue that we need to achieve emission reduction targets, and to live within tight carbon budgets. There have been some positive developments in Wales—it would be churlish not to acknowledge that—but it is vital that there's a plan to ensure that this happens on the scale and within the timescale that's required. I would therefore very much welcome support for this amendment. Diolch yn fawr.

[347] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Llyr Gruffydd.

[348] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I'll be supporting all amendments in this section and will clearly be speaking to my amendments here, the first of which is amendment 106, which calls for the adequacy of the climate change targets to be revised every five years. It is possible—in fact, it's probable, I think—that the international community will arrive at revised 2050 targets sometime during the next 35 years. I understand that there is some element of flexibility to the wording of the target, but I think that introducing a role for the advisory body and providing a power to vary the target would provide, I think, a stronger structure for responding to developments in the global efforts to reduce emissions.

[349] Amendment 107 is based on another recommendation of the committee's in our report—to require the first carbon budget to be set earlier than the end of 2018, and for the second and third carbon budgets to be



published before the end of 2018. The committee believe, of course, that the first budget could and should be published earlier than the end of 2018. The UK Committee on Climate Change provided evidence that this work could be completed by the end of 2017 and that it could provide advice to the Welsh Government on the first two or three carbon budgets during the second half of 2016. It also said that the current timeline proposed for the publication of the first carbon budget means that the first budget will only be able to act as a baseline for measuring future progress as there'll be very little time for industry, public bodies and the wider public to act on its delivery. Amendments 108 and 109 are consequential amendments to that particular amendment 107.

[350] Amendment 110 links interim emissions targets or carbon budgets with the application of the 'globally responsible Wales' goal in the wellbeing of future generations Act. This recognises and reinforces the policy link already expressed by the Welsh Government between the WFG Act, the Planning Act and the Environment Bill. In Scotland, of course, the climate change Act there expressly requires Scottish Ministers, when setting annual targets, to have regard to the objective of not exceeding the fair and safe Scottish emissions budget, which the Act defines as the aggregate amount of net Scottish emissions for the period 2010 to 2050 recommended by the relevant body as being consistent with Scotland contributing appropriately to stabilisation of greenhouse gas concentrations in the atmosphere. So, it's important that we contribute only what is fair and equitable in terms of the Welsh share of global carbon budgets as well.

[351] On amendment 111, we mustn't forget, of course, that the Welsh Government's climate change strategy, published back in 2010, already contains a target to reduce greenhouse gas emissions in Wales, particularly committing to a reduction of 40 per cent in greenhouse gas levels in all sectors by 2020 from 1990 levels. Now, this Bill will put in place a system of calculating Welsh emissions on a net rather than a territorial basis, but it's important that the 2020 target isn't lost in that transition.

[352] I support Government amendment 60 to specify two interim target years of 2030 and 2040, but of course, given that we already have a 2020 target as well, my amendments 60A and 60B propose inserting the already-agreed 2020 target as an interim target for completeness, and to ensure that existing commitments aren't lost as a result of the Bill.

[353] Amendment 30 in the name of Bill Powell, I'm content to support. If

we are to have targets and the 2050 target year gives us time to up our game, then, those targets must be stretching. It would also send out the clearest possible message to wider society in Wales how seriously we take our responsibilities in this respect. On amendment 31, limiting global warming to no more than two degrees has become the definitive target for global climate policy, as you say, so I support this amendment. I'll also support amendment 36. It's appropriate, I think, that we acknowledge the importance of renewable energy, and requiring the Government to produce a plan for renewables in Wales is something I very much support.

[354] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. A oes unrhyw un arall sydd eisiau siarad? Julie Morgan.  
**Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Does anyone else wish to contribute? Julie Morgan.

[355] **Julie Morgan:** Just very briefly, I think very important points are raised in this debate and certainly, they define our ambitions within Wales. So, I can see that aiming for 100 per cent, in William Powell's amendment 30, would give a strong message. I'd be interested in knowing from the Minister the reasons why he is not actually supporting that amendment, because I think it's obviously something that we'd all want.

[356] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Jenny Rathbone.

[357] **Jenny Rathbone:** Prevention is always better than amelioration, and I feel that we're not quite grasping the gravity of the situation in terms of the tipping point we're at with climate change. Measures taken earlier will make our task easier, as we approach the 2030–40 targets. So, I'd be keen to hear why the Government isn't being a little bit more ambitious and grasping the nettle on this one, because it's easy enough to set targets for 2030–40, because people may feel they're not going to be around to deliver on it, but I think we should be setting ourselves some ambitious targets, particularly this week in the week before the Paris conference, to show that we really do mean business on this one.

[358] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Janet Haworth.

[359] **Janet Haworth:** Thank you, Chair. I welcome the opportunity to speak to these amendments. Firstly, I would like to speak to amendment 127, which backs up the view that Wales cannot alter climate change alone. As Jenny Rathbone indicated earlier, we are a small country. It reinforces the importance of taking global responsibility for climate change and ensures

that, when making regulations, setting or changing an interim target year, this fact is taken into account.

[360] Wales has been quite successful at hitting climate change targets and can be rightly proud of some of the innovations and research and development that it has undertaken. But international progress is needed to make real impact. The future generations Act sets out one of the wellbeing goals in section 4 as a 'globally responsible Wales'. This amendment further supports this goal. We may get accused of allowing the Welsh Government room for manoeuvre on this issue if they fail to meet set targets. But I think that matters surrounding climate change are not always within our control. We think it prudent to also await the return of the Minister from the Paris conference.

[361] I wanted to point out that we will be voting against amendment 36 as well, as it seeks to put a requirement on Welsh Ministers to prepare and publish a plan for the promotion of renewable energy. As has been indicated earlier, the word 'promotion' compared to 'enhancement'—promotion is not about action, it's about publicity. If we're to take these matters seriously, we've got to do more than just say the right things and promote and publicise targets. We're opposing this amendment, because the Welsh Conservatives are supportive of evidence-based decisions in this important matter about the effectiveness of different types of energy production; a diverse mix of energy that also includes nuclear power as a clean and long-term generation of energy, which will also secure our energy into the future. Thank you.

[362] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Y Gweinidog i siarad. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. The Minister to speak.

[363] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I think this is a really important section of the Bill, which actually takes politics out of some of the issues that we've talked about. Actually, we've got a collective view on this. I think it's just about semantics and processes to get to what we're seeking to achieve. I absolutely agree with Bill's principle of an ambitious target, but our drafting of this amendment—our amendment—is not prohibitive to achieving that. Indeed, it says at least 80 per cent, which means the ambition is for this Government to pursue that with vigour beyond 80 per cent, and that could mean achieving 100 per cent. So, what you're seeking to do is still open as the Bill is drafted.

[364] There are some process issues of measurements, which I understand are important to Members, but I'd just raise the point that Llyr made reference to Scotland, and, importantly, to the contribution that they make to the global impact. I'd just remind the Member that they do have conditions in their environmental credentials, but they don't have a wellbeing of future generations Act, which we have strategic links into in terms of the wellbeing and resilience of our nation, both of Wales and the competencies surrounding that. So, we have, I believe, an added value in Wales in terms of the toolkit we are able to contribute to in terms of climate change.

[365] Again, Bill Powell's amendment 31 in relation to global warming within 2 degrees centigrade—the Member said it's a definitive target. Well, he's absolutely right, but it's today's definitive target, and I think actually, being ambitious, Paris in a week or two may come back with a different target, and what I wouldn't want to have on the face of this Bill is 2 degrees C, which is today's current target, but actually, in two weeks' time, that might be different. So I think it gives us scope to move in that respect. We are, as a Government, committed to it, and we've signed up to the Under 2 MOU. We were a signatory to that, but I actually do believe there is an opportunity to move further with international partners on that. In that respect, we will not be seeking to support that today.

[366] Julie and, I know, Jenny and members of this committee are absolutely key to making sure you push the Government and scrutinise the Government on looking at opportunities to drive forward the climate change agenda. I'm always keen to look at innovation. We've looked carefully at amendment 36 in regard to renewable targets and a renewable plan. I'm giving that some further thought. I'm not opposed to creating that, but you're quite right in terms of the devolution settlement not allowing us to do some things. I think what I would like to have is achievable ambition in terms of what we plan for the future. So, I will give that some further thought. We won't be supporting that amendment today, but it is something that I'll consider at the next stage. Again, I think that we are quite right, Janet, to be very proud of the actions we've taken here as a small nation. We do, and are able to, contribute to the larger contribution internationally. We are a member of the states and regions alliance, and we actively play a part in that as a vice-president of that organisation. Post Paris, I hope that we have enough flexibility within this Bill that we're not driven by today's targets on the face of the Bill, and we can have some flexibility to move that forward as we move forward in the progression of the Bill. I was pleased when the Member said that we should wait for myself to come back with possibly some more interesting news

about what Paris has been able to deliver, and maybe we can include that in the Bill as we move forward.

[367] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. William Powell i ymateb. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. William Powell to reply.

[368] **William Powell:** Diolch, Cadeirydd. I appreciate what the Minister says with regard to the words 'at least' being included there, and that there is scope for us to be more ambitious, but I would maintain my argument that the figure that is stated here is out of date and needs to be reviewed in terms of carbon emissions. I'm very pleased indeed to see the Minister coming under robust challenge from, maybe, the green flank within his own party, and I think that's to be welcomed, and having one's feet held to the fire on these matters is really quite important.

11:45

[369] I acknowledge what the Minister's had to say with regard to changing science, but maybe we do need to revisit that two degrees and come up with a more appropriate figure. I shall be backing today all of Llyr Gruffydd's amendments, and also Janet Haworth's amendment 127. I'll be happy to work on amended wording at Stage 3 in one or two of the respects in which the Minister has outlined. I'm sure that we all agree that it's one of the most important sections of this Bill. It's absolutely central to achieving its stated objectives, and it's one that has the potential for bringing about a more focused and effective approach to tackling climate change. It's important, therefore, that we get this section absolutely right, and I certainly join Janet in looking forward to the Minister coming back from Paris, from that vital meeting and series of talks, hopefully with some good news. Diolch yn fawr.

[370] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. William Powell, a ydych chi eisiau symud i bleidlais ar welliant 30? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. William Powell, do you wish to move to a vote on amendment 30?

[371] **William Powell:** Yes, please.

[372] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 30? **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 30 be agreed. Does any Member object? *[Objection.]* We'll *[Gwrthwynebiad.]* Symudwn i move to a vote. All those in favour of

bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant amendment 30, please indicate. 30 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Three. Those against, five. Tri. Yn erbyn, pump. Ymatal, dau. Abstentions, two. Therefore, the Felly, mae'r gwelliant yn syrthio. amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 30: O blaid 3, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 2.  
Amendment 30: For 3, Against 5, Abstain 2.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William	Antoniw, Mick Cuthbert, Jeff Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce	George, Russell Haworth, Janet

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 30.  
Amendment 30 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 58 (Carl Sargeant)  
Amendment 58 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[373] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 58 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn 58? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Na. Felly, mae gwelliant 58 yn cael ei dderbyn.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 58 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 58 be agreed. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 58 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 58 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 58 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[374] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 106?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 106?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 106 (Llyr Gruffydd, gyda chefnogaeth William Powell)  
Amendment 106 (Llyr Gruffydd, supported by William Powell) moved.*

[375] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ydw.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** Yes.

[376] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 106?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 106 be agreed. Does any

Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Member object? [*Objection.*] We move  
 [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais to a vote on amendment 106. All  
 ar welliant 106. Pawb sydd o blaid those in favour, please indicate. Five.  
 gwelliant 106, os gwelwch yn dda. Those against, five. Tied vote. I use  
 Pump. Pump yn erbyn. Cyfartal— my casting vote in the negative, and  
 pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn, felly mae'r therefore the amendment falls.  
 gwelliant yn syrthio.

*Gwelliant 106: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
 Amendment 106: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
Gruffydd, Llyr	Antoniw, Mick	
Jones, Alun Ffred	Cuthbert, Jeff	
Powell, William	Morgan, Julie	
George, Russell	Rathbone, Jenny	
Haworth, Janet	Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais  
 fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in  
 accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 106.  
 Amendment 106 not agreed.*

[377] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae hi'n Alun Ffred Jones: It's 11:50, and I'm  
 11:50, ac rwy'n awyddus, rwy'n eager to proceed to group 8.  
 credu, i symud ymlaen i grŵp 8.

[378] Do you have any objections to taking group 8 before lunch? You're  
 happy for me to do that. Right.

**Grŵp 8: Newid Hinsawdd: Adroddiadau, Datganiadau a Chyngor (Gwelliannau 126, 112, 32, 113, 33, 67, 34, 8, 9, 10, 114, 115, 69, 70, 35, 116, 11, 12, 90 a 117)**

**Group 8: Climate Change: Reports, Statements and Advice (Amendments 126, 112, 32, 113, 33, 67, 34, 8, 9, 10, 114, 115, 69, 70, 35, 116, 11, 12, 90 and 117)**

[379] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Therefore, we'll symudwn ymlaen i grŵp 8, newid move on to group 8, climate change: hinsawdd: adroddiadau, datganiadau reports, statements and advice. The a chyngor. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp lead amendment in the group is yma ydy gwelliant 126 yn enw Janet amendment 126 in the name of Janet Haworth, ac rwy'n galw ar Janet i Howarth, and I call on Janet to speak siarad am ei gwelliant a'r gwelliannau to her amendment and the other eraill yn y grŵp. amendments in the group.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 126 (Janet Haworth)  
Amendment 126 (Janet Haworth) moved.*

[380] **Janet Haworth:** Thank you, Chair. I have tabled amendment 126, which reflects the Stage 1 committee recommendation 35. It suggests that there should be annual reporting of progress in Wales towards the 2050 target. This amendment follows that rationale, with some support from Stop Climate Chaos Cymru, and mirrors aspects of the UK Act, whereby the Committee on Climate Change would be required to report to the Welsh Ministers, and the Ministers would then be required to respond. I believe that this will strengthen the Bill and make the Welsh Government more accountable on this issue. We are abstaining on the Lib Dem amendments 32 and 33, because we do not believe that the timescale needs to be shortened, and, in the case of 33 specifically, we do not feel that it may always be practicable to lay the carbon budget report within three months of the final statement. Whilst we, in theory, support the concept of measuring consumption, we are concerned that, at the moment, consumption can not always be fairly measured, and therefore we are abstaining on this amendment.

[381] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very fawr. Galwaf ar Llyr Gruffydd i siarad. much. I call on Llyr Gruffydd to speak.

[382] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch, **Llyr Gruffydd:** Thanks, Chair. Gadeirydd.



[383] My first amendment here is 112, or the first one I wish to—. Actually, it's the first one in the group as well, but I'll be speaking to it anyway. It's welcome that the Welsh Ministers are required, of course, to prepare and publish a report on the policies and proposals for meeting carbon budgets under section 39 of the Bill, but I believe that this five-yearly report explaining how they intend to meet the carbon budget should be laid before the National Assembly. I think that would be wholly appropriate, but I'd also seek clarification from the Minister as to the content of this report, on which I have to say there is vast detail in this section, albeit welcoming that it must cover the areas of responsibility for each Welsh Minister, which I think is a positive. So, maybe, in responding, the Minister could confirm whether what we're talking about here is a detailed action plan of the sort we've seen in Scotland and whether it'll set out what will be done by Government to meet its budgets and targets.

[384] Amendment 113: the challenge, of course, of tackling climate change should be a top priority across the Welsh Government. And, as I said, it's welcome that there's a requirement to prepare and publish a report under section 39(1) for each carbon budget period covering the areas of responsibility for each of the Welsh Ministers. However, that isn't currently mirrored in the requirement to prepare a final statement at the end of each budgetary period under section 41. This amendment will ensure that the final statement includes information on the area of responsibility of each individual Minister, ensuring that each Minister takes ownership and responsibility, then, of course, for meeting their own carbon budget.

[385] Amendments 114 and 115 are around annual reporting, and, clearly, annual reporting on progress towards meeting targets is essential. The current proposals in the Bill would only provide for a report every five years. Quite often, by then, of course, it will be reporting on the actions of the previous Government. There should be annual reporting of progress towards the 2050 target. To not provide that would be a regression from the existing Government reporting on climate action as things stand. The provision for reporting through the wellbeing of future generations Act, in my view, is not sufficient to give detailed consideration to climate change. The approach that I propose uses the UK Climate Change Act's report-and-respond system for annual reporting. Under this system, the advisory body, the Committee on Climate Change, of course, would be required to report to the Welsh Ministers on progress towards meeting the targets, and the Ministers would then be required to respond.

[386] Amendment 116: the Welsh Government's climate change strategy, published in 2010, of course, committed Wales, as I mentioned earlier today, to a reduction of 40 per cent in greenhouse gases in all sectors by 2020, compared to 1990 levels, but that's on a territorial gross basis. This Bill sets out a new system of having a net Welsh emissions account, which would involve a calculation of Wales's share of UK sales and purchases of the EU emissions trading scheme allowances, yet we haven't seen any data on what this means in practice. Will it make us less responsible for the emissions that we produce here in Wales, particularly, maybe, from some of the major emitters? Yes, I understand it's in line with other UK climate legislation, as the Minister, I'm sure, will point out when he responds. However, he will also know that there are discussions on a UK and Scotland level about moving their targets and budgets to a gross accounting system, and I wouldn't want Wales to be left behind and to have a weaker accounting system if this were to change in the next few years. It's an emerging situation, I understand, so I haven't proposed wholesale changes to the Bill's accounting system at this stage, but I would suggest maybe—or I'd be interested in hearing what the Minister has to say and certainly suggest that he speaks to colleagues in other parts of the UK about this issue.

[387] Amendment 117 reflects the committee's fortieth recommendation in our Stage 1 report calling on the Minister to provide a list of adaptation mechanisms alongside a description of the aspects of adaptation that they cover. Several stakeholders raised concerns about the absence of climate change adaptation measures in Part 2 of the Bill. The Climate Change Commission for Wales states that the lack of reference to adaptation in the Bill is a marked contrast to the UK Government, Northern Ireland and Scottish equivalents. In his letter to the committee dated 3 September, of course, the Minister said that there are no provisions on adaptation in the Bill as there are other mechanisms in the Bill and in other legislation to account for adaptation, such as the wellbeing of future generations Bill and the UK Climate Change Act 2008, but it certainly wasn't clear to the committee, at least, that all aspects are covered by existing mechanisms—for example, the adaptation of the energy sector or nationally significant infrastructure, such as key rail and water infrastructure. Therefore, I propose that we add a specific section to this to address this area, as articulated by the committee in our deliberations.

[388] In terms of other amendments, I'll be supporting them. Clearly, I'm formally supporting Bill Powell's amendment 34, that the Government should report on consumption as well as production emissions, although, actually, I

won't be supporting Government amendment 70. I think that three months is sufficient time to respond to the advisory body's report. Therefore, I don't really support doubling it to six months.

[389] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. William fawr. William Powell. Powell.

[390] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. My amendments 32 and 33 seek to address the concerns raised in evidence about the reporting on carbon budgets. In the consultation response from WWF, they stated their view that the reporting and statement cycle appeared to be an odd order of events, meaning that, at the start of the next budgetary period, the first event will be the report on how to meet the carbon budget for the new budgetary period, with proposals and policies covering the areas of responsibility of each Welsh Minister, then followed by the final statement, as we've heard earlier, concerning the previous budgetary period to which it relates, and, finally, a report on policies and proposals to compensate for any excess emissions in that previous budgetary period.

[391] These amendments seek to put this order of events on more rational footing to create a more logical sequence, by shortening, overall, the timescale for the section 41 statement—that's the final statement for a budgetary period—and the section 42 statement, namely the proposals and the policies where a carbon budget is not seen to be met. This would enable them to fit within the one-year timescale in section 39 for the setting of those carbon budgets.

[392] Amendment 34 addresses the committee's recommendation on the production and consumption emissions. We heard in numerous evidence sessions to our committee from stakeholders that the Welsh Government should report on consumption, as well as on production emissions. The UK Committee on Climate Change suggests that measuring and reporting on consumption emissions, alongside production emissions, should be specified in this Bill, and that would be in line with the Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009.

[393] Similarly, we also heard from the Climate Change Commission for Wales about the vital role of being able to communicate our consumption-based performance as a means of involving more people in gaining an understanding of the impact of decisions and behaviours of their own, and of their organisations, on climate change. Any additional information that could

be utilised to access programmes towards the 2050 targets should be reported on, and, as has been noted in the committee report, reporting on consumption emissions in Wales is especially important, given the balance between a minority of large-scale emitters, and the consumption of the outputs from those emitters within the country. For these reasons, I think the Bill should be amended in this particular respect.

[394] In terms of amendment 35, this amendment simply extends the parameters that Welsh Ministers are required to take into account when setting interim targets and budgets, as already included in the Bill, so as to apply to the advisory body also. The UK Climate Change Act 2008 is laid out in this way, and we heard from the UK Committee on Climate Change that they find the extension of the parameters to their advice very valuable. This is a straightforward amendment, set out to achieve this.

[395] Finally, amendment 90 seeks to enshrine in the Bill a requirement for a carbon assessment of fiscal budgets, requiring Welsh Ministers to produce a report describing the direct and indirect impact on greenhouse gas emissions of its expenditure plans. This is provided for, again, in the Scottish climate change Act, and this wording is mirrored in my amendment 90. This is a useful mechanism, I would argue, to consider the emission impact of Government spending and policies, which aims to mainstream this consideration into everyday Government business. It's also a similar tool to the current duty for an equality impact assessment of the fiscal budget. It also, I would argue, offers a useful lever to focus minds on outcomes, which Welsh Government policy has a requirement to consider at a strategic level. Currently, there seems to be very little consideration in the budget process as to the impact on emission reduction aims, and this has had cross-party support in this place, and elsewhere, for some years. Diolch yn fawr.

[396] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. A oes unrhyw Aelod arall eisiau siarad? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. Does any other Member wish to speak? Jenny Rathbone. Jenny Rathbone.

[397] **Jenny Rathbone:** I've listened carefully to what the Minister said in the earlier session—the earlier section—and I am pleased to understand that there will be a possibility to review the targets we may need to set, following Paris. But I hope that, at that point, we will then be setting some interim targets for 2020, so that we bind the next Government—whoever it is—to delivering on what we need to do for future generations.

12:00

[398] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Weinidog.

[399] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you. Again, it's a very important section following on from the earlier section on climate change too in regard to reporting. I think, to start, I'd just like to say, Chair, that we are one of the only countries in the world to introduce carbon budgeting into legislation. That tells you, I hope, how serious we are as a Government in terms of taking this forward. The other aspect of this is, obviously, the one of contention about reporting—about when you report and how you report. Of course, we have to take this in the context of Welsh legislation and how we measure and look at outcomes from what we do here. I've been quite clear with my team that what I don't want to do is be a Government that just measures things. I want to be able to demonstrate what we're doing and get on with the job, making sure that we can have a dramatic impact in the reduction of our impact, and globally, on climate change. That's why I'm a little concerned that there is a vast section of evidence of different views on reporting mechanisms. Indeed, the proposals in some areas asking for annual reporting—between five-yearly reporting—. We had, and I know you had, evidence from the Tyndall Centre. They gave evidence back in July, highlighting the importance of a five-year reporting cycle rather than some referencing a single yearly proposal. I think it's the trend we need to look at in terms of the long-term trend, as in the wellbeing of future generations Act, looking at how our impacts—how we are taking that forward.

[400] I think there are some very valid points in terms of the amendments made by Members, but the drafting, unfortunately, doesn't lend itself—. It complicates some of the proposals in the way that Members have drafted things in terms of duplication or, indeed, minimising some of the impact. I think Llyr's amendment 112 requiring Welsh Ministers to prepare and publish a report that they must lay before the National Assembly for the budgetary period on carbon budgeting is an important question. There will be comprehensive reporting, and I will, outside of this meeting, write to the committee in terms of detail about what we would expect that to look like just to give some confidence for Members. I think it is an important part for Members—not just for the one Minister, who manages the natural resources, to look after the budget for the whole of Government. I can tell you, as in the WFG Act, Ministers are taking this very seriously now, because it's their role and duty to comply too, and I'd expect that, and I'll give you a note on that principle.

[401] The amendments we have laid again make reference to changes, as recommended by committee recommendations, and we believe that we've helped strengthen the reporting and statement of advice processes through this Bill. We will not be seeking to support opposition amendments in this section. However, I am conscious, again, as I said in the earlier group, that there are some common objectives here that we just need to think about carefully in the drafting terms about how we can bring them forward. So, it's not an intent not to support you, because that's where we are. Actually, we do believe in some very similar aspects of this—it's just the way that this is drafted and will work within the context of Welsh legislation.

[402] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet Haworth to Haworth i ymateb. reply.

[403] **Janet Haworth:** Thank you, Chair. We will be supporting most of these amendments, but we will be abstaining on some of them. The ones we are abstaining on—it's because we believe it's very important that, in this area of climate change, we do have a can-do philosophy rather than a would-like-to-do. The Minister's made the point that this is the only Government that has sought to take these steps with regard to carbon budgets. Again, I would reiterate that I think it's only prudent to await the outcome of Paris and the discussions that take place there regarding methodology and carbon budgeting, I am sure. We are very aware in this committee of the difficulties of measuring consumption and production. If we're going to do these things, they must be fair and they must be equitable and they must be workable. I think that's very important in legislation. If we legislate in a way that is later found to not be equitable, fair or workable, that is weak and poor legislation and I don't think we want to do that. So, that's our thinking behind our abstentions. Thank you.

[404] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Do you want to vote on amendment 126?

[405] **Janet Haworth:** Yes. I move, Chair.

[406] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 126. amendment 126 be agreed. Any Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? objection? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i to a vote. All in favour of amendment bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 126, therefore, please. And against. 126, felly, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn It is a tied vote. There's a tied vote.

erbyn. Mae'n bleidlais gyfartal. Felly, So, I use my casting vote in the  
rwy'n bwrw fy mhleidlais fwrw yn negative and the amendment is not  
erbyn y gwelliant ac mae'n methu. agreed.

*Gwelliant 126: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 126: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:

Yn erbyn:

Ymatal:

For:

Against:

Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais  
fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in  
accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 126.*

*Amendment 126 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 59 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 59 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[407] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment  
gwelliant 59 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y 59 in the name of the Minister. The  
cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant question is that amendment 59 be  
59. Oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim agreed. Is there any objection? There  
gwrthwynebiad. Mae'r gwelliant yn is no objection. The amendment is  
pasio. agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 59 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 59 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[408] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, ydych **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to  
chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 60A? move amendment 60A?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 60A (Llyr Gruffydd).*

*Amendment 60A (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[409] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[410] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 60A. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 60A i ddangos. Yn erbyn. Ymatal. Mae'r gwelliant yn syrthio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 60A be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote, therefore. All those in favour of amendment 60A, please indicate. And against. Abstentions. The amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 60A: O blaid 3, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 2.*

*Amendment 60A: For 3, Against 5, Abstain 2.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 60A.  
Amendment 60A not agreed.*

[411] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 60B?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 60B?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 60B (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 60B (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[412] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[413] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 60B. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 60B i ddangos. Tri. Yn erbyn. Pump. Ymatal. Dau. Mae'r gwelliant yn syrthio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 60B be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote, therefore. All those in favour of amendment 60B, please indicate. Three. Against. Five. Abstentions. Two. The amendment is not agreed.



*Gwelliant 60B: O blaid 3, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 2.  
Amendment 60B: For 3, Against 5, Abstain 2.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:
Gruffydd, Llyr	Antoniw, Mick	George, Russell
Jones, Alun Ffred	Cuthbert, Jeff	Haworth, Janet
Powell, William	Morgan, Julie	
	Rathbone, Jenny	
	Watson, Joyce	

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 60B.  
Amendment 60B not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 60 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 60 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[414] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 60 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 60. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Felly, mae gwelliant 60 yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 60 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 60 be agreed. Any objection? There is no objection. Therefore, amendment 60 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 60 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 60 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[415] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 107?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 107?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 107 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 107 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[416] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[417] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 107. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 107 i ddangos. Pump. Yn

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 107 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote, therefore. All those in favour of amendment 107, please indicate. Five. And against. Five.

erbyn. Pump. Mae'n gyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Mae'r gwelliant yn colli. There's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative. The amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 107: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 107: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:
George, Russell	Antoniw, Mick	
Gruffydd, Llyr	Cuthbert, Jeff	
Haworth, Janet	Morgan, Julie	
Jones, Alun Ffred	Rathbone, Jenny	
Powell, William	Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 107  
Amendment 107 not agreed.*

[418] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, ydych chi eisiau cynnig gwelliant 108? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 108?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 108 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 108 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[419] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[420] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 108. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 108 i ddangos. Pump. Yn erbyn. Pump. Mae'n gyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Mae gwelliant 108 yn methu. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 108 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote, therefore. All those in favour of amendment 108 to indicate. Five. And against. Five. There's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative. Amendment 108 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 108: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 108: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:

George, Russell	Antoniw, Mick
Gruffydd, Llyr	Cuthbert, Jeff
Haworth, Janet	Morgan, Julie
Jones, Alun Ffred	Rathbone, Jenny
Powell, William	Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).  
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 108.  
Amendment 108 not agreed.*

[421] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment gwelliant 109. 109.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 109 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 109 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[422] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[423] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 109. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 109 i ddangos. Pump. Yn erbyn. Pump. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn erbyn ac mae gwelliant 109 yn syrthio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 109 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 109 to indicate. Five. And against. Five. The casting vote is in the negative and amendment 109 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 109: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 109: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 109.*

*Amendment 109 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 61 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 61 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[424] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 61 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 61. Oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 61 yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 61 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 61 be agreed. Is there any objection? There is no objection. Amendment 61 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 61 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 61 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 62 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 62 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[425] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 62 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 62. Oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 62 yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 62 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 62 be agreed. Is there any objection? There is no objection. Amendment 62 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 62 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 62 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 63 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 63 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[426] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 63 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 63 yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 63 in the name of the Minister. Is there any objection? There is no objection. Amendment 63 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 63 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*  
*Amendment 63 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 64 (Carl Sargeant).*  
*Amendment 64 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[427] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 64 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 64 yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 64 in the name of the Minister. Is there any objection? There is no objection. Amendment 64 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 64 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*  
*Amendment 64 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[428] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 31?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you wish to move amendment 31?

[429]

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 31 (William Powell, gyda chefnogaeth Llyr Gruffydd).*  
*Amendment 31 (William Powell, supported by Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[430] **William Powell:** Cynnig.

**William Powell:** Move.

[431] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 31. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 31 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Pump. Yn erbyn. Pump. Mae'n gyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Mae'r gwelliant yn colli.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 31 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote, therefore. All those in favour of amendment 31 to indicate, please. Five. And against. Five. There's a tied vote so the casting vote is in the negative. The amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 31: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 31: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:

George, Russell	Antoniw, Mick
Gruffydd, Llyr	Cuthbert, Jeff
Haworth, Janet	Morgan, Julie
Jones, Alun Ffred	Rathbone, Jenny
Powell, William	Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 31.  
Amendment 31 not agreed.*

[432] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, amendment gwelliant 127. 127.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 127 (Janet Haworth).  
Amendment 127 (Janet Haworth) moved.*

[433] **Janet Haworth:** I move, Chair.

[434] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symudwn i bleidlais. Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 127. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 127 i ddangos. Pump. Yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Mae gwelliant 127 yn colli.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** We'll proceed to a vote. The question is that amendment 127 be agreed. Any objection? [Objection.] We'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 127 to indicate. Five. And against. There's a tied vote and the casting vote is in the negative. Amendment 127 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 127: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 127: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:

George, Russell	Antoniw, Mick
Gruffydd, Llyr	Cuthbert, Jeff
Haworth, Janet	Morgan, Julie
Jones, Alun Ffred	Rathbone, Jenny
Powell, William	Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 127.  
Amendment 127 not agreed.*

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 110.      **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment 110.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 110 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 110 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[435] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[436] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn gwelliant 110. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 110 i ddangos. Tri. Yn erbyn. Pump. Ymatal. Dau. Mae gwelliant 110 yn colli.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 110 be agreed. Any objection? [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 110 to indicate. Three. Against. Five. Abstentions. Two. Amendment 110 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 110: O blaid 3, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 2.  
Amendment 110: For 3, Against 5, Abstain 2.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 110.*  
*Amendment 110 not agreed.*

[437] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment  
gwelliant 111. 111.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 111 (Llyr Gruffydd).*  
*Amendment 111 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[438] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[439] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw **Alun Ffred Jones:** Is there any  
wrthwynebiad i welliant 111? objection to amendment 111?  
[*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote,  
bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid therefore. All those in favour of  
gwelliant 111 i ddangos. O blaid. Tri. amendment 111 to indicate. In  
Yn erbyn. Pump. Ymatal. Dau. Mae'r favour. Three. And against. Five.  
gwelliant yn colli. Abstentions. Two. Therefore, the  
amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 111: O blaid 3, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 2.*  
*Amendment 111: For 3, Against 5, Abstain 2.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 111.*  
*Amendment 111 not agreed.*

[440] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you  
gwelliant 89. wish to move amendment 89?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 89 (William Powell).*  
*Amendment 89 (William Powell) moved.*

[441] **William Powell:** Cynnig. **William Powell:** I move.



[442] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad i welliant 89? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 89 i ddangos. O blaid. Pump. Yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Mae gwelliant 89 yn colli.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Is there any objection to amendment 89? [Objection.] We'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 89 to indicate. Five. And against. The vote is tied. The casting vote is in the negative. Amendment 89 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 89: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 89: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:
George, Russell	Antoniw, Mick	
Gruffydd, Llyr	Cuthbert, Jeff	
Haworth, Janet	Morgan, Julie	
Jones, Alun Ffred	Rathbone, Jenny	
Powell, William	Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).  
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 89.  
Amendment 89 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 65 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 65 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[443] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 65 yn enw'r Gweinidog. A ddylid derbyn gwelliant 65? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 65 yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 65 in the name of the Minister. Do we accept amendment 65? Any objection? There's no objection. Amendment 65 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 65 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 65 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 66 (Carl Sargeant).*  
*Amendment 66 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[444] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 66 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 66 yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 66 in the name of the Minister. Any objection? There's no objection. Amendment 66 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 66 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*  
*Amendment 66 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 6 (Carl Sargeant).*  
*Amendment 6 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[445] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 6 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 6 yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 6 in the name of the Minister. Is there any objection? There's no objection. Amendment 6 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 6 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*  
*Amendment 6 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 7 (Carl Sargeant).*  
*Amendment 7 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[446] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 7 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 7 yn cario.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 7 in the name of the Minister. Is there any objection? There's no objection. Amendment 7 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 7 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*  
*Amendment 7 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[447] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 112.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment 112.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 112 (Llyr Gruffydd).*  
*Amendment 112 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[448] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[449] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw wrthwynebiad i welliant 112? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 112 i ddangos. O blaid. Pump. Yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Mae gwelliant 112 yn colli.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Is there any objection to amendment 112? [Objection.] We'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 112 to indicate. Five. And against. The vote is tied. So, the casting vote is in the negative. Amendment 112 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 112: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 112: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 112.  
Amendment 112 not agreed.*

[450] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, gwelliant 32.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** William, amendment 32.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 32 (William Powell).  
Amendment 32 (William Powell) moved.*

[451] **William Powell:** Cynnig.

**William Powell:** I move.

[452] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw wrthwynebiad i welliant 32?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Is there any objection to amendment 32?

[*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote. bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant All those in favour of amendment 32 32 i ddangos. Yn erbyn. Pump. to indicate. And against. Five. Ymatal. Dau. Mae gwelliant 32 yn Abstentions. Two. Amendment 32 is colli. not agreed.

*Gwelliant 32: O blaid 3, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 2.  
Amendment 32: For 3, Against 5, Abstain 2.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:
Gruffydd, Llyr	Antoniw, Mick	George, Russell
Jones, Alun Ffred	Cuthbert, Jeff	Haworth, Janet
Powell, William	Morgan, Julie	
	Rathbone, Jenny	
	Watson, Joyce	

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 32.  
Amendment 32 not agreed.*

[453] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment gwelliant 113. 113.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 113 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 113 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[454] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Griffydd:** I move.

[455] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw **Alun Ffred Jones:** Is there any wrthwynebiad i welliant 113? objection to amendment 113? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote, bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid therefore. All those in favour of gwelliant 113 i ddangos. Pump. Yn amendment 113 to indicate. Five. erbyn. Pump. Mae'n gyfartal. Pleidlais And against. Five. The vote is tied fwrw yn erbyn. Mae gwelliant 113 yn and the casting vote is in the colli. negative. Amendment 113 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 113: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 113: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 113.  
Amendment 113 not agreed.*

[456] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, **Alun Ffred Jones:** William,  
gwelliant 33. amendment 33.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 33 (William Powell).  
Amendment 33 (William Powell) moved.*

[457] **William Powell:** Cynnig. **William Powell:** I move.

[458] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw **Alun Ffred Jones:** Is there any  
wrthwynebiad i welliant 33? objection to amendment 33?  
[*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i [*Objection.*] So, we'll proceed to a  
bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid vote. All those in favour, please  
gwelliant 33 i ddangos, os gwelwch indicate. And against. And  
yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Ac yn ymatal. abstaining. So, amendment 33 is  
Felly, mae gwelliant 33 yn pasio. agreed.

*Gwelliant 33: O blaid 8, Yn erbyn 0, Ymatal 2.  
Amendment 33: For 8, Against 0, Abstain 2.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Morgan, Julie

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet

Powell, William  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 33.  
Amendment 33 agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 67 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 67 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[459] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 67—. Dyna dipyn o gyffro i'r—. [Chwerthin.] Gwelliant 67 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 67? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae 67 yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Amendment 67—. There was a little bit of excitement there. [Laughter.] Amendment 67 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 67 be agreed. Is there any objection? There's no objection. So, 67 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 67 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 67 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[460] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, gwelliant 34.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you wish to move amendment 34?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 34 (William Powell, gyda chefnogaeth Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 34 (William Powell, supported by Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[461] **William Powell:** Cynnig.

**William Powell:** I move.

[462] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw wrthwynebiad i welliant 34? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly, ar welliant 34. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 34 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Ymatal. Mae gwelliant 34 yn colli.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Is there any objection to amendment 34? [Objection.] We'll proceed to a vote, therefore, on amendment 34. All those in favour of amendment 34 to indicate. And against. And abstaining. Amendment 34 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 34: O blaid 3, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 2.  
Amendment 34: For 3, Against 5, Abstain 2.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 34.  
Amendment 34 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 8 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 8 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[463] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 8 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad i welliant 8? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 8 yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 8 in the name of the Minister. Is there any objection to amendment 8? There's no objection. Amendment 8 is therefore agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 8 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 8 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 9 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 9 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[464] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 9 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 9 yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 9 in the name of the Minister. Is there any objection? There's no objection. Amendment 9 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 9 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 9 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 10 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 10 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[465] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 10 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 10 in the name of the Minister. Is there any objection? There's no

gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 10 yn objection. Amendment 10 is agreed.  
pasio.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 10 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 10 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[466] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment  
gwelliant 114. 114.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 114 (Llyr Gruffydd).*

*Amendment 114 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[467] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[468] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Oes unrhyw **Alun Ffred Jones:** Is there any  
wrthwynebiad i welliant 114? objection to amendment 114?  
[*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote.  
bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant All those in favour of amendment  
114 i ddangos. Pump. Yn erbyn. 114, please indicate. Five. And  
Pump. Mae'n gyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw against. Five. That's a tied vote. The  
yn erbyn. Mae gwelliant 114 yn colli. casting vote is in the negative.  
Amendment 114 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 114: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 114: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais  
fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in  
accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 114.*

*Amendment 114 not agreed.*



*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 68 (Carl Sargeant).*  
*Amendment 68 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[469] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 68 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 68 yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 68 is the name of the Minister. Any objection? There's no objection. Amendment 68 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 68 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*  
*Amendment 68 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[470] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 115.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment 115.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 115 (Llyr Gruffydd).*  
*Amendment 115 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[471] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[472] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad i welliant 115? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 115. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Mae gwelliant 115 yn methu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Is there any objection to amendment 115? [Objection.] We'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 115. And against. There's a tied vote. The casting vote is in the negative. Amendment 115 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 115: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*  
*Amendment 115: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais*

*fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 115.*

*Amendment 115 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 69 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 69 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[473] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment gwelliant 69 yn enw'r Gweinidog. 69 in the name of the Minister. Is Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim there any objection? There's no gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 69 yn objection. Amendment 69 is agreed. pasio.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 69 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 69 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 70 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 70 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[474] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment gwelliant 70 yn enw'r Gweinidog. 70 in the name of the Minister. Is Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? there any objection? [*Objection.*] We'll [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i proceed to a vote. Will all those in bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant favour of amendment 70 indicate, 70 i ddangos. Saith. Ac yn erbyn. Tri. please? Seven. And against. Three. Mae'r gwelliant yn pasio. The amendment is agreed.

*Gwelliant 70: O blaid 7, Yn erbyn 3, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 70: For 7, Against 3, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:

For:

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

Yn erbyn:

Against:

Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Ymatal:

Abstain:

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 70.*  
*Amendment 70 agreed.*

12:15

[475] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, **Alun Ffred Jones:** William,  
gwelliant 35. amendment 35.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 35 (William Powell).*  
*Amendment 35 (William Powell) moved.*

[476] **William Powell:** Cynnig. **William Powell:** I move.

[477] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad i welliant 35? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Is there any objection to amendment 35?  
[*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote.  
bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid y Would all those in favour of  
gwelliant, felly. Pump. Yn erbyn. amendment 35 indicate? Five. And  
Pump. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn against. Five. The vote is tied, so the  
erbyn. Mae'r gwelliant wedi'i golli. casting vote is in the negative and  
the amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 35: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*  
*Amendment 35: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*  
*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 35.*  
*Amendment 35 not agreed.*

[478] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment  
gwelliant 116. 116.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 116 (Llyr Gruffydd).*  
*Amendment 116 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[479] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[480] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A oes **Alun Ffred Jones:** Is there any  
unrhyw wrthwynebiad i welliant 116? objection to amendment 116?  
[*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i [*Objection.*] We'll proceed to a vote.  
bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant Would all those in favour of  
116 i ddangos. Pump. Yn erbyn. amendment 116 indicate? Five. And  
Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Mae against. Five. The vote is tied, so the  
116 wedi'i golli. casting vote is in the negative and  
amendment 116 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 116: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*  
*Amendment 116: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:	Yn erbyn:	Ymatal:
For:	Against:	Abstain:
George, Russell	Antoniw, Mick	
Gruffydd, Llyr	Cuthbert, Jeff	
Haworth, Janet	Morgan, Julie	
Jones, Alun Ffred	Rathbone, Jenny	
Powell, William	Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais  
fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*  
*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in  
accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 116.*  
*Amendment 116 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 11 (Carl Sargeant).*  
*Amendment 11 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[481] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment  
gwelliant 11 yn enw'r Gweinidog. A 11 in the name of the Minister. Is

oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim there any objection? There is no  
gwrthwynebiad. Mae'r gwelliant yn objection, so the amendment is  
pasio. agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 11 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 11 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 12 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 12 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[482] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment  
gwelliant 12 yn enw'r Gweinidog. A 12 in the name of the Minister. Is  
oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim there any objection? There is no  
gwrthwynebiad. Mae'r gwelliant yn objection, so the amendment is  
pasio. agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 12 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 12 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 71 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 71 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[483] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment  
gwelliant 71 yn enw'r Gweinidog. A 71 in the name of the Minister. Is  
oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim there any objection? There is no  
gwrthwynebiad. Mae'r gwelliant yn objection, so the amendment is  
pasio. agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 71 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 71 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 72 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 72 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[484] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment  
gwelliant 72 yn enw'r Gweinidog. A 72 in the name of the Minister. Is  
oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim there any objection? There is no  
gwrthwynebiad. Mae'r gwelliant yn objection, so the amendment is  
pasio. agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 72 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 72 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 73 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 73 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[485] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 73 yn enw'r Gweinidog. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae'r gwelliant yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 73 in the name of the Minister. Is there any objection? There is no objection, so the amendment is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 73 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 73 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[486] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, gwelliant 36.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** William, amendment 36.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 36 (William Powell).*

*Amendment 36 (William Powell) moved.*

[487] **William Powell:** Cynnig.

**William Powell:** I move.

[488] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad i welliant 36? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 36 i ddangos. Tri. Yn erbyn. Saith. Mae'r gwelliant wedi'i golli.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Is there any objection to amendment 36? [Objection.] We'll proceed to a vote. Would all those in favour of amendment 36 please indicate? Three. And against. Seven. So, the amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 36: O blaid 3, Yn erbyn 7, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 36: For 3, Against 7, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 36.*

*Amendment 36 not agreed.*

[489] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, **Alun Ffred Jones:** William,  
gwelliant 90. amendment 90.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 90 (William Powell).*

*Amendment 90 (William Powell) moved.*

[490] **William Powell:** Cynnig. **William Powell:** I move.

[491] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad i welliant 90? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Is there any objection to amendment 90? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i [Objection.] We'll proceed to a vote. bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 90 i ddangos. Pump. Yn erbyn. Pump. Would all those in favour of amendment 90 please indicate? Five. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. And against. Five. The vote is tied, so Mae'r gwelliant wedi'i golli. the casting vote is in the negative and the amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 90: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 90: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 90.*

*Amendment 90 not agreed.*

[492] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment

gwelliant 117.

117.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 117 (Llyr Gruffydd).*

*Amendment 117 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[493] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[494] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad i welliant 117? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 117. Yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Mae gwelliant 117 wedi'i golli.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Is there any objection to amendment 117? [Objection.] We'll proceed to a vote. Would all those in favour of amendment 117 please indicate? And against. The vote is tied, so the casting vote is in the negative and amendment 117 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 117: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 117: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:

Yn erbyn:

Ymatal:

For:

Against:

Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 117.*

*Amendment 117 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 74 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 74 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[495] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 74 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 74 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 74 be



gwelliant 74? A oes unrhyw agreed. Is there any objection? There wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. is no objection, so the amendment is Mae'r gwelliant yn pasio. agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 74 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 74 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[496] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Er nad oes **Alun Ffred Jones:** Although we have gennym ni—wel, cwestiwn da: a no—well, good question: do you want ydych chi eisiau bwrw ymlaen? to carry on?

[497] What would you like to do? We can take a break now, or carry on. There's a request for five minutes. So, we'll take five minutes—literally five minutes. Okay? If you're not back, I'm starting.

*Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 12:18 a 12:25.*

*The meeting adjourned between 12:18 and 12:25.*

**Grŵp 9: Bagiau Siopa a Gwastraff (Gwelliannau 37, 128, 38, 39, 129, 130, 40, 131, 132, 75, 41)**

**Group 9: Carrier Bags and Waste (Amendments 37, 128, 38, 39, 129, 130, 40, 131, 132, 75, 41)**

[498] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rydym ni **Alun Ffred Jones:** We have reached wedi cyrraedd grŵp 9, sy'n ymwneud group 9, which relates to carrier bags â bagiau siopa a gwastraff. Y prif and waste. The lead amendment in welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 37 yn this group is amendment 37 in the enw William Powell, ac rwy'n galw ar the name of William Powell, and I call on William Powell—croeso, William—i William Powell—welcome, William—to gynnig gwelliant 37, ac i siarad i'r move amendment 37, and to speak to the amendment and the other gwelliant ac i'r gwelliannau eraill. amendments in the group.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 37 (William Powell).*

*Amendment 37 (William Powell) moved.*

[499] **William Powell:** I firstly speak to amendments 37 and 38 in this group. I fully support our committee's recommendation that the proceeds of any new arrangements regarding carrier bag charges, including bags for life, be directed at environmental causes operating within Wales, and I believe that there are strong arguments in favour of this being implemented. For

instance, I believe that it maximises the opportunity for lasting, embedded behavioural change, and also helps to reinforce the link between minimising waste on the one hand, and the benefits this has on the environment. This is supported by the fact that 72 per cent of respondents in the outreach survey felt that proceeds should go to environmentally based charities. However, as has been pointed out previously, there are a number of existing arrangements whereby the proceeds go to charities that are not environmental in nature—children’s hospices, animal charities for instance, and also air ambulances in some cases. These arrangements work very well, and I’m sure that charities are very welcoming towards those additional funds and put them to the best of uses. So, I want to be very clear that these are amendments not intended to put an end to existing arrangements, but for them to apply to any new arrangements. The committee’s recommendation is that these proceeds are only directed towards charities operating in Wales, and I think it’s important to uphold that.

[500] Linked to this is amendment 39, which relates to the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee recommendation that the Bill should require there to be a charge for carrier bags sold or delivered to persons in Wales, and for the net proceeds of that charge to be applied to charitable purposes. This replaces the discretionary power to impose a charge, which is provided for in section 55 of the Bill.

[501] Amendment 40 is in line with the CLAC recommendation. Section 63 of the Bill provides for the making of carrier bag regulations for England and Wales in one instrument. When questioned about this in committee, Minister, you said that you didn’t have any intention to use those provisions, and you stated, and I quote,

[502] ‘We’re making Welsh laws here.’

[503] As such, CLAC felt that this section of the Bill was unnecessary and could be removed in its entirety.

[504] Finally, my amendment 41 is on the deposit return scheme. This has already been discussed on a number of occasions, including yesterday in the Chamber, so I won’t rehearse all of those arguments today. But I would just reiterate that I would like to see the Welsh Government being proactive on this, either by commissioning a feasibility study, or perhaps running a pilot scheme in Wales. Any decision to pursue or reject the scheme must be evidence based, and, given the level of political and public support that this

proposal seems to be gaining, I hope that the Minister can give some serious thought to it. It would also be possible to engage with Minister-President Kretschmann from our partners over in Baden-Württemberg, and other colleagues across the globe, where successful schemes have been in operation for some time. Diolch yn fawr.

[505] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Rwy'n galw ar Janet Howarth i siarad. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. I call on Janet Howarth to speak.

[506] **Janet Howarth:** Thank you, Chair. I'm speaking to a number of amendments in this section, and I'm just indicating to you now that we will be opposing amendment 38. Amendments 121 and 129 directly speak about the carrier bag levy. Amendment 128 speaks about the employee threshold, and having a 250 employee threshold for the size of business affected mirrors the situation in England. It would seem strange to have two different limits. We also need to consider the impact that this levy has on small and medium-sized businesses. Amendment 129 opens up the scope for the money raised by the carrier bag charge to go to a range of community projects, and not just environmental charities. We believe it is important to engage with local interests and listen to what the community wants, and not make decisions on the charity centrally without consultation.

12:30

[507] We all have local groups in our areas who would be delighted to receive a little extra funding, and we all know that these groups achieve quite a lot with quite small amounts—you know, £200, £300, £400. They're able to do quite a lot with those sums. Why should they be barred because they don't fulfil the criteria of an environmental charity?

[508] Amendment 130 questions the need for an administrator to oversee the carrier bag levy. We feel concern that we do not wish to see another tsar in the shape of a carrier bag, and would be interested to know how the Minister is planning to minimise the cost and bureaucracy that could be associated with such a role. We will be opposing the Lib Dem amendment 38 as this amendment is in direct opposition to the Welsh Conservative amendment 129. We do not believe it is appropriate to limit the causes that the proceeds of the carrier bag charge can go to.

[509] Amendment 131 supports the Stage 1 committee recommendation 43,

and this amendment ensures that any regulation brought forward under section 45AA of the Environmental Protection Act 1990 inserted by section 66 of this Bill includes the TEEP test. In a letter to the Environment and Sustainability Committee dated 3 September, the Minister acknowledged that there may be an increase in costs for some businesses. As the Bill stands, proposals could place additional pressures on small businesses, and, without the TEEP test included in regulations, there is a risk of separation requirements being out of kilter with the collection arrangements in particular areas. We know that that's not consistent across the country at the moment.

[510] Finally in this group, amendment 132 seeks to insert additional information into the Bill. As the Bill stands, there is no way to argue biodigestion is not discharging food waste to the sewer. Due to the very specific definition of food waste given in this Bill, this makes the Bill very definitive and restrictive at this stage. I work closely with a company called Mechline, and the Minister and I have had a conversation about this. Manufacturers of food waste biodigesters produce what Welsh Water define as waste water, or grey water, which is not food waste. It is acceptable to them that this enters the sewer. This amendment allows waste water to be discharged to the sewer when it has been through an enzyme treatment and contains suspended solid particulates of less than 2 mm. By failing to accept this amendment, we could be having a major and unintended impact on Mechline and other similar businesses, and some of these are in quite early development, you know, because it's working with biological research and development as well. So, we wouldn't want to put any barriers in the way of those developments. Thank you.

[511] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. A oes unrhyw Aelodau eraill sydd eisiau siarad? Russell George. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Do any other Members wish to speak? Russell George.

[512] **Russell George:** Thank you, Chair. I just want to say I fully concur with the comments of my colleague, Janet Haworth. Whether I need to or not, I'm not sure, but, for the record, Chair, I will just put on the record that I am a director of a small business that charges for carrier bags and makes donations to various organisations.

[513] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Julie Morgan.

[514] **Julie Morgan:** Thank you, Chair. I just wanted to comment on a few of

the amendments. On amendment 41 by William Powell, in principle I think that this is a good way to go forward. I know we've debated it at length, so I won't say any of these arguments, but I would ask the Minister in his response that he could tell us what he plans to do in order to look at this in greater detail. I know that Scotland has done quite a bit of work on this and has done a consultation, and I think it would be useful if we could look at that consultation when it comes out. I know that there are concerns about expense, and some of the supermarkets and convenience stores have expressed anxiety about it. So, I wondered if he could indicate whether he's open to this idea and whether it's something that could be taken forward.

[515] On Janet Haworth's amendment about businesses employing 250 more employees, I think that would be an extremely retrograde step, and I see no reason why we should try to get in line with what they're doing in England. It would be more appropriate, I think, if they had tried to work more closely with what we had done, seeing as we started it such a long time before. So, I hope that we'll all strongly oppose that particular amendment.

[516] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Jeff Cuthbert.

[517] **Jeff Cuthbert:** Well, I agree very much with what Julie Morgan has just said. One of the main criticisms of the carrier bag scheme that's been launched in England is that it's very complicated, whereas ours is a simple scheme. I can imagine enormous arguments about whether or not a particular business employs 250 or more, whether they'd want to break it down to individual stores, or what have you. So, I'm most certainly opposed to that amendment.

[518] In terms of the principles of enzymes being used to break down food waste, I am aware of the issues concerned with the specific firm that you've mentioned—it's in my constituency and I've been to see them—and I would be grateful if the Minister could explain how the science can be fully understood and perhaps taken account of in due course.

[519] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch. I'll be supporting most amendments in this group, particularly amendment 38 from Bill Powell around the benefits from the charges for the bags. The reason I think we should be looking towards supporting environmental charities operational in Wales with any new arrangement is because the charge is environmentally motivated and I think there's a clear link there that we shouldn't lose. So, I think it would make perfect sense.

[520] I subsequently won't be supporting Janet Haworth's amendment 129, and I would concur wholly with the comments made around the deposit-return scheme, as well, and amendment 41. We did discuss this yesterday and I've already indicated my support. I understand, of course, that we would need to pilot and test some ideas before implementing a full-blown scheme, but I think there's a clear direction of travel that does enjoy cross-party support in the main, and it would be good for the Government to move a bit more decisively in that direction.

[521] I won't be supporting the 250-employee threshold. As has already been said, it would be a step back and, therefore, I'll be voting against amendment 128. As regards a plastic bags tsar, there might not be much detail in the Bill, but somebody has to administer it, and I wouldn't for a second imagine that even this Government would be wishing to establish a plastic bags commissioner, or something of that sort. So, I think it's unfortunate that the amendment has been laid, because, clearly, if we're legislating, then we have to have a way of delivering and administering it.

[522] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Jenny Rathbone.

[523] **Jenny Rathbone:** I'm sympathetic towards William Powell's amendment. I think it's important that we uphold the successful arrangements we have at the moment and we don't want people blatantly ignoring the regard for the environment and therefore undermining popular support for it. I definitely don't think there's a role for a plastic bags tsar. I think that there is a role for the citizen. So, I think that if we can ensure, perhaps, some simple way of ensuring people know how many bags businesses have sold in exchange for the 5p and what they'd done with it, even if they've done nothing with it and put it in their own pockets, at least the citizen then knows what's happened to it and can challenge that. We've seen how Hugh Fearnley-Whittingstall's programmes have challenged the way in which supermarkets operate their waste. So, I'd like to see something that's not onerous, and, obviously, complies with the requirement to bag up raw meat, which I think is going to be included in the arrangements we already have.

[524] So, I definitely oppose Janet Haworth's amendments and the idea that anything on this matter could be learnt from what England's getting up to, particularly after yesterday's announcements, definitely not. So—

[525] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Could we keep to the subject?

[526] **Jenny Rathbone:** Okay. In terms of the amendment that Janet Haworth has put forward after her conversation with Mechline, I did originally give this quite considerable consideration, because of the outcome, but I think the important point here is the need to reduce, reuse, recycle, and we obviously want to reduce food waste—No. 1—but where it's unavoidable we need to be putting it to good use. Putting it down the drain is not a good use. Creating energy out of food waste or converting it into fertiliser and enriching the ground is a good use. I'm convinced that we have to stop what might be an unintended consequence of this Bill if we don't legislate in this regard. So, I hear what Mechline has to say but I don't think that we should be exempting this loophole in the Bill. I think it would have very serious adverse consequences potentially.

[527] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Joyce Watson.

[528] **Joyce Watson:** Thank you, Chair. I want to speak particularly to amendment 128. I can't and won't be supporting 'and employs 250 or more employees'. I'm not going to rehearse the argument, but it would be undoubtedly a retrograde step. I also will be supporting William Powell with his amendment 40 for the same reason: that we can't align ourselves to a Government whereby we are tied to things that we clearly can't support from this point forward.

[529] I also want to speak to amendment 41. That's the deposit and returns scheme. Now, in principle, I would have supported this, but the practical issues that surround it, as currently proposed, give me enough concerns not to support it at this stage and in this form. There are a few issues for me that have been highlighted by small businesses, but also, I think, for myself, there is the potential creaming off, if you like, of the very high-end material by those who suddenly catch on quite quickly to this. You have a dual system in place that will actually militate against all the good things that the local authorities are doing at the moment and the benefits that have been derived by those collections in terms of the money that they are making and reinvesting in other services. So, it's on that basis that I cannot, in its form, support that.

[530] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. A gaf i alw ar y Gweinidog? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. May I call on the Minister?

[531] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair, and to the committee for their comments. Can I start with amendment 40? I will be seeking to support William Powell's amendment at that stage. Can I also just mention amendments 37, 38 and 39? They raise some—. I can absolutely understand the committee, they've been consistent with their approach through this process, but we do have some drafting issues with that process. What I will do is seek to come back at Stage 3 with an amendment that will be comfortable with the committee, but I can't support it in that draft form today. But, I do understand what the committee is seeking there.

[532] With regard to amendment 41 on the deposit–return scheme, we are working with Scotland to see how they are developing the system. It's something that I'm not opposed to in terms of a scheme, but it has to be a practical process and we have to understand how it would work. We are at very high levels of reuse and recycling. What I don't want to happen is for that just to be distorted into a different stream—that it moves into a deposit–return scheme as opposed to the recycling and reuse end. If it adds value, I'm certainly interested in doing that, and we can learn from other countries. I am looking at that. I don't believe that we need legislation to move forward with that; therefore, I won't be supporting amendment 41. However, I will be taking further work forward on looking at how and whether it would be appropriate to introduce it into Wales in the future. I will keep Members informed of that.

[533] I won't be supporting—which is of no surprise—amendment 128 in the name of Janet Haworth. That is, I believe, as Members have said, a retrograde step.

12:45

[534] I don't believe that the English regulations around carrier bag charging have been or are effective. I think they could have learned an awful lot of lessons from the very successful programme we have seen here in Wales, and therefore I'll be seeking for Members to oppose that.

[535] The issue of one of the constituents of Jeff Cuthbert, who I have met with, in terms of this issue around a particular company and their particular method of dealing with food waste, has raised some issues. I have read the detail of the process. Can I just remind Members of the purpose of this Bill? It is because we do believe that food waste, while regrettable, is of value at some point, and it has a huge contribution in terms of energy value. It's



estimated that around 21,000 tonnes of food waste is being disposed of to the sewer in Wales, by businesses and the public sector. To put that into context, that would be enough to fill an anaerobic digester producing around 1 MW of electricity with the ability to power 1,500 households a year. We cannot allow that to continue, and I do understand the issues of the technology, but at the end of the day I do understand that the certification of waste water by companies has been accepted, but ultimately there's still food waste at source, and we need to make sure we take that out of the system. I have asked my team to have discussions with the company involved, particularly the one based in Wales, to see how that may impact, or indeed whether there are any other opportunities that we can help the company with. We don't believe at this stage it is a considerable change to their business, but it is something that I will keep abreast of. But, I cannot accept that amendment in this form today.

[536] My final point is regarding the amendment on the TEEP regulations tabled by Janet. I do recognise that change is always challenging for organisations, particularly small and medium-sized enterprises. We are in the development of these regulations, and we will ensure that there is no conflict between the existing TEEP regulations and the necessity test and the new requirements that this Bill will take forward. So, we are mindful of that, but we will be seeking to reject that amendment that you've tabled today. It is one that, interestingly, creates a lot of excitement around the carrier bag levy, and interest from Members and members of the public, but it's something that we've given a lot of consideration to in making sure that we can demonstrate that we are having a very positive effect on our environment too.

[537] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. William Powell i ymateb. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. William Powell to reply.

[538] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. It's notable that we've had probably the most vigorous debate of the whole morning around this particular topic. I'm grateful also for the Minister's thoughtful response. Obviously, I'll be voting against amendment 129. It seems to be in direct conflict with my own amendments, and I empathise with some of the comments we've heard around the table. I will also be voting against amendment 128 as it reduces the scope of the levy, and I don't think we've got a whole lot to learn from the other side of Offa's Dyke in this regard. I understand the Minister's position with regard to the deposit-return scheme. It was obviously building support here. I will move my amendments on this, but I hope that we can

clarify the position post-Paris, during Stage 3, so as to get an outcome here that can take this important initiative forward. Finally, I'm pleased that a number of the amendments that I'm bringing forward have been accepted in principle. I hope that we can work at Stage 3 again to refine some more of the detail. In terms of amendment 132, I don't have sufficient understanding of the science or the impact, at the moment, of that matter of biological digestion and the discharge of food waste into sewers. So, at this stage I shall be abstaining. Diolch yn fawr.

[539] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. A ydych chi eisiau symud gwelliant 37, William? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Do you wish to move amendment 37, William?

[540] **William Powell:** Cynnig. **William Powell:** I move.

[541] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 37: a oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 37 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn, felly mae'r gwelliant wedi syrthio. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Amendment 37: any objections? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 37, please indicate. And those against. There's a tied vote. The casting vote is in the negative and the amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 37: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 37: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
------------------	-----------------------	---------------------

George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Haworth, Janet Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William	Antoniw, Mick Cuthbert, Jeff Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Watson, Joyce
---	--

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).  
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 37.*

*Amendment 37 not agreed.*

[542] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, amendment  
gwelliant 128. 128.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 128 (Janet Haworth).*

*Amendment 128 (Janet Haworth) moved.*

[543] **Janet Haworth:** I move.

[544] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw **Alun Ffred Jones:** Any objections to  
wrthwynebiad i welliant 128? amendment 128? [*Objection.*] We'll  
[*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. move to a vote. All those in favour of  
Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 128 i amendment 128, please indicate. In  
ddangos. O blaid. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'r favour. And against. The amendment  
gwelliant wedi ei golli. falls.

*Gwelliant 128: O blaid 2, Yn erbyn 8, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 128: For 2, Against 8, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Morgan, Julie  
Powell, William  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 128.*

*Amendment 128 not agreed.*

[545] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, **Alun Ffred Jones:** William,  
gwelliant 38. amendment 38.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 38 (William Powell, gyda chefnogaeth Llyr Gruffydd).*

*Amendment 38 (William Powell, supported by Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[546] **William Powell:** Cynnig.

**William Powell:** I move.

[547] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw **Alun Ffred Jones:** Any objections to wrthwynebiad i welliant 38? amendment 38? [*Objection.*] We'll [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i move to a vote. All those in favour of bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant amendment 38 please indicate. 38 i ddangos. Yn erbyn. Mae'r Those against. The amendment falls. gwelliant wedi'i golli.

*Gwelliant 38: O blaid 3, Yn erbyn 7, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 38: For 3, Against 7, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 38.  
Amendment 38 not agreed.*

[548] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, gwelliant 39. amendment 39.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 39 (William Powell, gyda chefnogaeth Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 39 (William Powell, supported by Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[549] **William Powell:** Cynnig.

**William Powell:** I move.

[550] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw **Alun Ffred Jones:** Any objections to wrthwynebiad i welliant 39? amendment 39? [*Objection.*] We'll [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i move to a vote. All those in favour of bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant amendment 39 please indicate. Five. 39 i ddangos. Pump. Yn erbyn. Pump. Against. Five. It's a tied vote. The Mae'n gyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn casting vote is in the negative. erbyn. Mae gwelliant 39 wedi'i golli. Amendment 39 falls.

*Gwelliant 39: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 39: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 39.*

*Amendment 39 not agreed.*

[551] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, amendment gwelliant 129. 129.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 129 (Janet Haworth).*

*Amendment 129 (Janet Haworth) moved.*

[552] **Janet Haworth:** I move.

[553] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw **Alun Ffred Jones:** Any objections to wrthwynebiad i welliant 129? amendment 129? [*Objection.*] We'll [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i move to a vote. All those in favour of bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant amendment 129 please indicate. 129 i ddangos. Dau. Yn erbyn. Wyth. Two. Against. Eight. Therefore, the Felly, mae'r gwelliant wedi'i golli. amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 129: O blaid 2, Yn erbyn 8, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 129: For 2, Against 8, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Morgan, Julie  
Powell, William

Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 129.*  
*Amendment 129 not agreed.*

[554] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, amendment  
gwelliant 130. 130.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 130 (Janet Haworth).*  
*Amendment 130 (Janet Haworth) moved.*

[555] **Janet Haworth:** I move.

[556] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw **Alun Ffred Jones:** Any objections to  
wrthwynebiad i welliant 130? amendment 130? [*Objection.*] We'll  
[*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i move to a vote. All those in favour of  
bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant amendment 130. Two. Against. Eight.  
130. Dau. Yn erbyn. Wyth. Felly, Therefore, the amendment falls.  
mae'r gwelliant wedi'i golli.

*Gwelliant 130: O blaid 2, Yn erbyn 8, Ymatal 0.*  
*Amendment 130: For 2, Against 8, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Morgan, Julie  
Powell, William  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 130.*  
*Amendment 130 not agreed.*

[557] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, **Alun Ffred Jones:** William,  
gwelliant 40. amendment 40.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 40 (William Powell, gyda chefnogaeth Carl Sargeant a*

*Llyr Gruffydd).*

*Amendment 40 (William Powell, supported by Carl Sargeant and Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[558] **William Powell:** Cynnig.

**William Powell:** I move.

[559] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw wrthwynebiad i welliant 40? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae'r gwelliant yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Any objections to amendment 40? No objections. The amendment is carried.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 40 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 40 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34*

[560] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, gwelliant 131.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, amendment 131.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 131 (Janet Haworth).*

*Amendment 131 (Janet Haworth) moved.*

[561] **Janet Haworth:** I move.

[562] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw wrthwynebiad i welliant 131? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 131. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'n gyfartal. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Felly, mae'r gwelliant wedi'i gollu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Any objections to amendment 131? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 131. And those against. It's a tied vote. The casting vote is in the negative. Therefore, the amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 131: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 131: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 131.  
Amendment 131 not agreed.*

[563] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, amendment gwelliant 132. 132.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 132 (Janet Haworth).  
Amendment 132 (Janet Haworth) moved.*

[564] **Janet Haworth:** I move.

[565] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw **Alun Ffred Jones:** Any objections to wrthwynebiad i welliant 132? amendment 132? [*Objection.*] We'll [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i move to a vote. All those in favour of bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant amendment 132 please indicate. 132 i ddangos. Dau. Yn erbyn. Saith. Two. Those against. Seven. There is Mae un yn ymatal. Felly, mae one abstention. Amendment 132 gwelliant 132 wedi'i golli. falls.

*Gwelliant 132: O blaid 2, Yn erbyn 7, Ymatal 1.  
Amendment 132: For 2, Against 7, Abstain 1.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Haworth, Janet

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

Powell, William

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 132.  
Amendment 132 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 75 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 75 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*



[566] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 75 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Felly, mae'r gwelliant yn pasio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 75 in the name of the Minister. Any objections? There are no objections. Therefore, the amendment is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 75 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 75 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[567] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, gwelliant 41.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** William, amendment 41.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 41 (William Powell, gyda chefnogaeth Llyr Gruffydd).*

*Amendment 41 (William Powell, supported by Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[568] **William Powell:** Cynnig.

**William Powell:** I move.

[569] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw wrthwynebiad i welliant 41? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 41 i ddangos. Pump. Ac yn erbyn. Pump. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Mae'r gwelliant wedi'i golli.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Any objections to amendment 41? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 41 please indicate. Five. And those against. Five. The casting vote is in the negative. The amendment falls.

*Gwelliant 41: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 41: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 41.  
Amendment 41 not agreed.*

**Grŵp 10: Trwyddedu Morol a Draenio Tir (Gwelliannau 133, 76 a 77)  
Group 10: Marine Licensing and Land Drainage (Amendments 133, 76 and  
77)**

[570] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rydym felly yn dod at y grŵp olaf, grŵp 10: trwyddedu morol a draenio tir. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 133 yn enw Janet Haworth, ac rwy'n galw ar Janet i siarad i'w gwelliant. Diolch yn fawr.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** That brings us to the final group, group 10: marine licensing and land drainage. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 133 in the name of Janet Haworth, and I call on Janet to speak to her amendment. Thank you very much.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 133 (Janet Haworth).  
Amendment 133 (Janet Haworth) moved.*

[571] **Janet Haworth:** Thank you, Chair. I'm pleased to introduce this final group of amendments on marine licensing and land drainage. We've tabled one amendment in this group, number 133. This amendment aligns the appeals process for the shellfisheries and marine licensing. When someone working in the marine industry, at appeal, has their notice varied or cancelled, this amendment could force the Welsh Government to pay them compensation for loss of earnings. I feel that this is vital to help protect our coastal fishing and shellfish industry, and would urge the Minister to back this amendment. We will also be supporting the other two amendments in this group.

[572] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. A oes Aelod eisiau siarad ar hwn? Neb. Y Gweinidog i siarad, felly.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Does any other Member wish to speak on this? No. So, I call on the Minister.

[573] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. In the final group of amendments, I wish to support amendments 76 and 77. Amendment 76 provides the Welsh Ministers with powers to bring forward regulations to set out new arrangements for the calculation of drainage rates. Amendment 77 is consequential to that. Amendment 133 would be inconsistent with the

existing provisions for appeals against notices within the Marine and Coastal Access Act 2009. I therefore do not support this amendment, and would ask Members to do the same.

[574] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Sorry, can you reiterate that? I didn't hear correctly. On amendment 133.

[575] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes, I was about to give you some more detail on that, Chair.

[576] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Sorry.

[577] **Carl Sargeant:** With regard to 133, with regard to marine licensing, this would be inconsistent with the existing provisions for appeals against notices within the Marine and Coastal Access Act 2009. We want one appeals procedure for all marine licensing notices, and we propose to adopt the same procedures for setting the appeals mechanism that are already set out in the Marine and Coastal Access Act 2009. The intention of the amendment is to have some consistency. If Janet's amendments are pursued, it would cause unnecessary duplication and, as a result, a disjointed approach to the notice appeals, which we believe would be unfavourable to the industry.

[578] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Ocê, diolch **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very yn fawr. Janet i ymateb. much. I call on Janet to respond.

[579] **Janet Haworth:** Thank you, Chair. I would only like to add that during committee we did hear evidence from this section of the marine industry about some of their frustrations around the deadlines and the process of carrying through their applications or, indeed, their appeals. And I'm a bit disappointed that we can't do something to make life a bit easier for them.

[580] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Ocê, diolch **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very yn fawr iawn. Felly, a ydych chi eisiau much. Therefore, do you wish to symud i bleidlais ar welliant 133? proceed to a vote on amendment 133?

[581] Do you want to move amendment 133?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 133 (Janet Haworth)*  
*Amendment 133 (Janet Haworth) moved.*

[582] **Janet Haworth:** Move.

[583] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad i welliant 133? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 133. Ac yn erbyn. Un yn ymatal. Felly, mae'r gwelliant wedi colli.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Is there any objection to amendment 133? [*Objection.*] Therefore, we'll proceed to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 133. And against. One abstaining. Therefore, the amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 133: O blaid 4, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 1.*

*Amendment 133: For 4, Against 5, Abstain 1.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

Jones, Alun Ffred

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 133.*

*Amendment 133 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 76 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 76 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[584] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 76 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Mae wedi ei dderbyn.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 76 in the name of the Minister. Is there any objection? That is accepted, therefore.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 76 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 76 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 77 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 77 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[585] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 77 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 77 in the name of the Minister. Is there any objection? There's no

gwrthwynebiad. Gwelliant 77 wedi objection. Therefore, amendment 77 pasio. is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 77 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 77 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 78 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 78 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[586] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment gwelliant 78 yn enw'r Gweinidog. 78 in the name of the Minister. Any Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim objection? There's no objection, gwrthwynebiad. Gwelliant wedi pasio. therefore the amendment is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 78 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 78 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 13 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 13 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[587] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment gwelliant 13 yn enw'r Gweinidog. 13 in the name of the Minister. Is Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim there any objection? There's no gwrthwynebiad. Gwelliant 13 wedi objection. Therefore, amendment 13 pasio. is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 13 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 13 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[588] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Janet, amendment gwelliant 134. 134.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 134 (Janet Haworth)*

*Amendment 134 (Janet Haworth) moved.*

[589] **Janet Haworth:** I move.

[590] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A oes **Alun Ffred Jones:** Is there any unrhyw wrthwynebiad i welliant 134? objection to amendment 134? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symud i bleidlais, [Objection.] We'll proceed to a vote, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 134 therefore. All those in favour of

os gwelwch yn dda i ddangos. Pump. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw yn erbyn, ac felly mae'r gwelliant wedi syrthio.

amendment 134, please indicate. Five. And against. That's a tied vote, and the casting vote is in the negative, and therefore the amendment is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 134: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 134: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Haworth, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Antoniw, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 134.  
Amendment 134 not agreed.*

[591] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A gaf i ddiolch i'r Gweinidog a'i swyddogion am fod yn bresennol ac am helpu? Mi fydd yna drawsgrifiad o'r cyfarfod. Mae hyn yn dod â thrafodion Cyfnod 2 i ben. Bydd Cyfnod 3 yn dechrau yfory, a bydd y dyddiadau perthnasol yn cael eu cyhoeddi maes o law. Mae'r Rheolau Sefydlog yn gwneud darpariaeth i'r Gweinidog baratoi memorandwm esboniadol diwygiedig sy'n ystyried y gwelliannau y cytunwyd arnynt heddiw. Bydd y memorandwm yn cael ei osod o leiaf pum diwrnod gwaith cyn trafodion Cyfnod 3. Cynhelir y cyfarfod nesaf ar

**Alun Ffred Jones:** May I thank the Minister and his officials for their presence and for helping us? A transcript of the meeting will be available. This completes Stage 2 proceedings. Stage 3 begins tomorrow, and the relevant dates will be published in due course. Standing Orders make provision for the Minister to prepare a revised explanatory memorandum taking account of the amendments agreed today. The revised memorandum will be laid at least five working days before Stage 3. The next meeting will be held on 2 December when the

2 Rhagfyr pan fydd y pwyllgor yn committee will continue with its parhau ei ymchwiliad i ddyfodol ynni inquiry into a smarter energy future craffach i Gymru. A gaf i ddiolch i'r for Wales. I thank all the staff and the staff i gyd ac i'r Aelodau am eu Members for their assistance as we cymorth wrth ddelio gyda'r Bil yma y have dealt with this Bill this morning. bore yma? Diolch yn fawr iawn. Thank you very much.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12:58.*

*The meeting ended at 12:58.*